THESIS ADVISER RECOMMENDATION LETTER

This thesis entitled "Indonesia’s Indirect Engagement Towards Australia After The Bali Nine Case: The Efforts to Increase Australian Tourists To Indonesia (2015-2016)" prepared and submitted by Zahara Sakinah Abdullah in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of Arts in the Faculty of Humanities has been reviewed and found to have satisfied the requirements for a thesis fit to be examined. I therefore recommend this thesis for Oral Defense.

Cikarang, Indonesia, January 2018

[Signature]
Teuku Rezasyah, Ph.D
Thesis Adviser
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I declare that this thesis, entitled "Indonesia’s Indirect Engagement Towards Australia After The Bali Nine Case: The Efforts to Increase Australian Tourists To Indonesia (2015-2016)" is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, an original piece of work that has not been submitted, either in whole or in part, to another university to obtain a degree.

Cikarang, Indonesia, January 2018

[Signature]

Zahara Sakinah Abdullah
The Panel of Examiners declare that the thesis entitled "Indonesia's Indirect Engagement Towards Australia After The Bali Nine Case: The Efforts to Increase Australian Tourists to Indonesia (2015-2016)" that was submitted by Zahara Sakinah Abdullah, majoring in International Relations from the Faculty of Humanities was assessed and approved to have passed the Oral Examination on 14 February 2018.

Hendra Manurung, S.IP., MA.
Chair – Panel of Examiners

Natasya Kusumawardani, S.IP., MProfStuds (Hons)
Thesis Co-Adviser – Examiner

Teuku Rezasyah, Ph.D
Thesis Adviser
ABSTRACT

Title: Indonesia's Indirect Engagement Towards Australia After The Bali Nine Case: The Efforts to Increase Australian Tourists to Indonesia (2015-2016)

The bilateral cooperation between Indonesia and Australia is one of the most important cooperation in the history of international cooperation in the world. In 2015, this bilateral cooperation was restrained because of the execution of two Australians that were included in Bali Nine case, Chan and Sukumaran, by Indonesian law. Australia, both the government and the citizens, showing a strong opposing reaction towards this act by Indonesia by withdrawing their ambassador and boycotting one of holiday destinations of Indonesia, which is Bali. Whereas, Australian tourists are one of the majority tourists that come to Indonesia, especially Bali. In result, in that year, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia got decreased slightly. Tourism sector is one of the important sector that is being the primary focus of Indonesian economy enhancement under the presidency of Joko Widodo. Therefore, in order to revive the number of Australian tourists, Indonesia engaged to Australia to re-attract and re-build the trust of Australia. This research has found that the engagement of Indonesia towards Australia through sport tourism, cooperation between sister cities, cultural festival, trade mission and trade fair, free visa-entry, and awareness distribution regarding other holiday destinations beside Bali has proven to attract the Australian tourists to go to Indonesia. In result, Australian tourists coming to Indonesia got increased in the following year after the case.

Keyword: Indonesia, Australia, bilateral cooperation, tourism, engagement
ABSTRAK


Kata kunci: Indonesia, Australia, kerja sama bilateral, pariwisata, keterlibatan
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Firstly, I would like to give my gratitude to the Almighty God, Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala, for the countless blessings and help that He had granted for me in life. Without His help, I cannot be where I stand today with the finished thesis as one of the requirement in order to graduate from this university.

Secondly, I would like to give countless thanks to the most important people in my life. My one and only parents, the best parents a child could ever have, my father Eddhien Abdullah and my mother Shanty Kurnely. Their unconditional love and daily struggle at work only for me and my brother to become successful persons drive me to become better and achieve more each day. My little brother Zahran F. Abdullah for being a good brother from the day he was born. The main persons that helped me to finished this thesis, Mr. Teuku Rezasyah, Ph.D. and Ms. Natasya Kusumawardani, MProfStuds(Hons), whom without them I would be a clueless final semester university student. Big thanks also given to all of the lecturers of International Relations President University, for their knowledge and guidance from my freshman year until this final year that have turned me to be more open-minded about what is happening in this world and how to interpret it in the form of paper.

And then, I would like to thank my best friends, the apple of my university life, Time Capsule -- Rizka Kristanti, Fika Dian Nuranita, Arin Wijaya Hutapea, Steven Wijaya, and Yuliana Doloksaribu, that has given me many supports and helping hands whenever I am in need and whom without them I would hardly survived these college years. Thank you Lukie Shantika Togas and Yuni Artiningsih for staying in touch with me even after we graduated from high school and giving me all of the supports through our random jokes. I would also like to give my thanks to Ms. Ornella, my supervisor number two at the internship workplace, for giving me inspirations and enlightenment in deciding which topic of thesis that I should write. And of course, the people of Social Responsibility and
Corporate Communication of United Tractors, Ms. Erika, my supervisor number one Ms. Meyta, Mr. Dimas, Mr. Rohman and Mr. Handi, for their support and also many lessons in work and life itself.

Lastly, I would like to thank everyone that has been truly helpful in supporting me from the beginning of my college year until now. I will always be thankful of your kindness and may you all be granted more blessings.

Cikarang, January 2018

Zahara Sakinah Abdullah
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THESIS ADVISER RECOMMENDATION LETTER ........................................... i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY ................................................................. ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PANEL OF EXAMINER APPROVAL SHEET ......................................................... iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT .................................................................................................. iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .................................................................................. vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENT ................................................................................ v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................ x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES ...................................................................................... xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ....................................................................... xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER I ............................................................................................... 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Background of Study ......................................................................... 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Problem Identification ...................................................................... 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Research Question ............................................................................. 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Objective of Research ...................................................................... 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. Significance of Research .................................................................. 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. Theoretical Framework ..................................................................... 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.1. International Cooperation ............................................................. 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.2. Bilateralism ..................................................................................... 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.3. Engagement .................................................................................... 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7. Scope and Limitations of the Study .................................................. 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8. Thesis Structure ............................................................................... 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.8.1. Chapter I – Introduction.................................................... 12
1.8.2. Chapter II – Literature Review........................................ 13
1.8.3. Chapter III – Research Methodology.................................. 13
1.8.4. Chapter IV – Bali Nine Case and Indonesia-Australia
Tourism Cooperation Amid The Case (2005-2015)........ 13
1.8.5. Chapter V – The Engagement between Indonesia and
Australia After The Case of Bali Nine................................. 13
1.8.6. Chapter VI – Conclusion.................................................. 14

CHAPTER II.............................................................................................. 15

LITERATURE REVIEW.................................................................................. 15

2.1. After hegemony : Cooperation and Discord in the World Political
Economy by Robert O. Keohane......................................................... 15

2.2. International Theories of Cooperation among Nations: Strengths and
Weaknesses Review Article by Helen Milner................................. 16

2.3. Multilateralism, Bilateralism, and Unilateralism in Foreign Policy by
Atsushi Tago............................................................................................. 17

2.4. Containment and Engagement as Middle-Range Theories by Gerda
Jakštaite.................................................................................................... 18

2.5. Australia’s Relations with Indonesia: Progress despite economic and
socio-cultural constraints? By Christopher B. Roberts and Ahmad D.
Habir............................................................................................................ 19

2.6. Dinamika Hubungan Bilateral Indonesia-Australia Pascahukuman
Mati Chan dan Sukumaran by Lisbet................................................. 20

2.7. Balancing Abolitionism and Cooperation on The World’s Scale : The
Case of The Bali Nine by Ronli Sifiris.................................................. 21

2.8. Connecting Australia and Indonesia by Asia Society Australia....... 22
2.9. Potensi Wisata Olah Raga dalam Meningkatkan Kunjungan Wisatawan by Marhanani Tri Astuti

CHAPTER III
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY
3.1. Research Method
3.1.1. Method of Data Collection
3.2. Research Framework
3.3. Research Instruments

CHAPTER IV
4.1. History of Bilateral Cooperation
4.2. Bilateral Relations between Australia and Indonesia
4.2.1. Political Cooperation
4.2.2. Economic Cooperation
4.2.3. People-to-People Links
4.3. Bali Nine Case
4.3.1. District Court Session
4.3.2. High Court Session
4.3.3. Supreme Court Session
4.4. Indonesia and Australia Dealing with The Case

CHAPTER V
THE ENGAGEMENT BETWEEN INDONESIA AND AUSTRALIA AFTER THE CASE OF BALI NINE
5.1. Indonesia-Australia Relationship After the Case................................. 49

5.2. The Interest of Indonesia........................................................................ 51

5.3. Engagement of Indonesia towards Australia........................................ 52

5.3.1. People-to-People Engagement.......................................................... 55

5.4. Indirect Engagement of Indonesia to Australia to Increase Australian Tourists to Indonesia................................................................. 56

5.4.1. Engagement Year 2015..................................................................... 57

5.4.2. Engagement Year 2016..................................................................... 64

5.5. The Result of Engagement by Indonesia towards Australia................. 70

CHAPTER VI.................................................................................................... 75

CONCLUSION.................................................................................................... 75

BIBLIOGRAPHY.................................................................................................. 77

APPENDIX........................................................................................................... 87
LIST OF TABLES

Table 5.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from year 2005 to 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from April to May 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from May to June 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from June to July 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from July to August 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from August to September 2015.

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from September to December 2015.

Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from January to March 2016.

Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from April to May 2016.

Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from May to October 2016.

Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from October to December 2016.

Table 5.5. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from year 2015 to 2016.

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.6.2. Engagement theory approaches by Gerda Jakštaitė

Figure 3.2. Framework of Indonesia-Australia engagement after the Bali Nine case in the effort to improve Indonesian tourism sector

Figure 5.2. Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia 2005-2015.

Figure 5.4.1. Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia on May to December 2015.
Figure 5.4.2. Australian Tourists Coming to Indonesia on 2016.

Figure 5.5. Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia 2005-2016.
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>= Australian Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACICIS</td>
<td>= The Australian Consortium for <code>In-Country</code> Indonesian Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFP</td>
<td>= Australian Federal Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AII</td>
<td>= Australia-Indonesia Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIMF</td>
<td>= Australia-Indonesia Ministerial Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIPRD</td>
<td>= Australia-Indonesia Partnership for Reconstruction and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIYEP</td>
<td>= Australia-Indonesia Youth Exchange Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>= Association of Southeast Asian Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUS</td>
<td>= Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BNN</td>
<td>= Badan Narkotika Nasional (National Narcotic Bureau)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRIDGE</td>
<td>= Building Relations through Intercultural Dialogue and Growing Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEPKES</td>
<td>= Departemen Kesehatan (Health Department)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>= Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IA-CEPA</td>
<td>= Indonesia-Australia Comprehensive Economic Partnership Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>= International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>= Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODA</td>
<td>= Official Development Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIF</td>
<td>= Trade Investment Framework</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
UN = United Nations
WIFEST = Wonderful Indonesia Festival
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of Study

Death Penalty is the term that applies to capital punishment and is the worst and the highest level of penalty that given for committing a murder or an extremely heinous assault.¹ For some states, death penalty is no longer being performed as the release of Universal Declaration of Human Rights with its third article that stated, “Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person”, acknowledged that death penalty is agreed to be abolished by the 48 countries who had voted the declaration.²

The making of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights also led to the more binding human rights treaties. Since 1960s, the draftees of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) had started to make a movement in supporting the abolishment of death penalty in international law, even though there are still many countries that implement the death penalty.³ Then, it was finally adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) on 16 December 1966, with its sixth article that stated “every human being has the inherent right to life. This right shall be protected by law. No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his life”.⁴

aiming to the abolition of the death penalty also being adopted and being declared formally by General Assembly resolution 44/128 in 15 December 1989.5

Pragmatically, death penalty is done for the protection of society, where the criminals have to be executed in order for a safer environment.6 It is a form of self-defense in order to stop the crime to be done again by the same perpetrator.7 However, death penalty, from the approach of human rights, is rejected because all human beings have the right to redeem and improve themselves and the state has no right and necessity to execute a captive citizen to eliminate crimes that is brutal in the perspective of societies.8 This approach believes on second chance towards the criminal and no crime should be resulted to death penalty towards the perpetrator in order to eliminate the crime itself.

In this moment, where the human rights are widely recognized and being concerned, many countries have not use this form of punishment and had eliminated it from their law. More than 160 member states of the United Nations with diverse legal systems, traditions, cultures and religious backgrounds acknowledge that the death penalty is not in the respect of human dignity and have agreed also that the contribution to enhance the development of human rights is by the abolishment of death penalty.9 It is acknowledge that the protection of human rights is upheld by most of the states in the world by the abolishment of death penalty.

Human rights protection also being doubt as why it is determined by international bodies or judges to be applied by all, whereas some societies, especially with the representatives that has been elected democratically may have chosen a particular path.10 Following this, several countries still implement the

---

7 Ibid.
capital punishment to punish criminals after some specific crimes they had done. According to Amnesty International, China, Iran, Saudi Arabia, Iran and Pakistan are the countries where death penalty majorly takes place. Indonesia is among one of the countries that still implements capital punishment. In Indonesia, capital punishment only implemented to murder, other offenses resulting in death, terrorism-related offenses resulting in death, terrorism-related offenses not resulting in death, robbery not resulting in death, drug trafficking not resulting in death, economic crimes not resulting in death, treason, espionage, military offenses not resulting in death, war crimes, crimes against humanity and genocide.

Indonesia has ratified the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and The Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, which are the treaties that against capital punishment. However, it still chose to keep going with the capital punishment towards the criminals of some specific cases that has been mentioned above. The reason was because Indonesia refers to the second verse of Article 6 in International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights which is stated, “in countries which have not abolished the death penalty, sentence of death may be imposed only for the most serious crime in accordance with the law in force at the time of the commission of the crime and not contrary to provisions of the present Covenant and to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. This penalty can only be carried out pursuant to a final judgement rendered by a competent court.”

On April 29, 2015, two criminals that was part of Bali Nine from Australia, Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran, were executed by firing squad.

---

in Indonesia as the result of drug smuggling with 8.3 kg heroine by foreign citizen in Indonesia.\textsuperscript{15} This execution was done as a part of effort by Indonesian government to fight against drug crimes that threaten the survival of the nation. This was a brave act taken by the government of Indonesia. However, this case and execution done by Indonesian firing squad has caused major negative reaction by foreign international actors, including Australia, its government and citizens, and other NGOs that are focusing on human rights such as Amnesty International.

Despite on many negative reactions from many sides of international society, President of Indonesia Joko Widodo still chose to hold on with his decision to execute the drug smuggler as an act of fighting against drug crimes that has claimed many lives of Indonesian youth. Joko Widodo has stated that it is a positive decision by him to eradicate the drug crime in Indonesia, that he has to stand by the law to secure the nation of Indonesia and its young generation from the bad effects of drug crime and he hoped that another foreign actors, especially Australia could understand that. The reason is because Indonesia refers to the second verse of Article 6 in International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights which is stated, “in countries which have not abolished the death penalty, sentence of death may be imposed only for the most serious crime in accordance with the law in force at the time of the commission of the crime and not contrary to provisions of the present Covenant and to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. This penalty can only be carried out pursuant to a final judgement rendered by a competent court”.\textsuperscript{16}

Related to the article above, according to the official bulletin from DEPKES (Health Department), in 2013 the drugs smuggler in education level, ironically senior high school level, is the highest rank of using drugs, defeated other college levels.\textsuperscript{17} Therefore, the government and BNN (National Narcotics

\textsuperscript{17} Kementrian Kesehatan RI. (2014). Situasi dan Analisis Penyalahgunaan Narkoba. InfoDATIN.
Institute) has announce and decided that Indonesia is in narcotics emergency situation.

1.2. Problem Identification

This case then resulted into some restrain of cooperation between both countries in many sectors. The Australian government deeply regretted the executions of Chan and Sukumaran after lots of clemency plea that had been given to Indonesian president by the lawyers and also the Australian prime minister. Eventually, withdrawing their Ambassador was the first thing that Australia did in response of the execution, followed by suspending ministerial visit.18 This act then led to a possible threat of loose cooperations. Australia and Indonesia has done lots of cooperation as two neighbouring countries, such as tourism sector. Tourism is one of important sectors in the economy of Indonesia where it enhance the national economic growth and generated employment. Not to forget also that this sector is the potential source of foreign exchange and enhance income tax of the country. In tourism sector, many Australians would choose Bali as their first option to go to holiday and Australians are also named as one of the majority tourists in Indonesia.

Regarding the death penalty towards the two Australian, Bali governor Made Mangku Prastika even stated his optimistic view on tourism of Bali to not be affected by soured diplomatic relations between Jakarta and Canberra over the imminent execution of Chan and Sukumaran on Friday, 6 March 2015.19 However, the Australians were also actively giving their protest and opposition towards the criminals’ execution. Australian Foreign Minister Julie Bishop even warned tourism to Bali could be threatened if the execution still being implemented to the two Australian drug smuggler, as in her official statement, “

think the Australian people will demonstrate their deep disapproval of this action, including by making decisions about where they wish to holiday.\textsuperscript{20}

Many statements of disapproval are posted via social media by most of the Australian and even have made a viral social media campaign #BoycottBali as a form of disapproval.\textsuperscript{21} It first appeared in late January 2015 after clemency for both Chan and Sukumaran had been denied by Indonesian president Joko Widodo. This case then certainly affected the bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Australia in every aspect of their cooperation as two countries. Indonesian government also realized about this possibility of restrained cooperation. Indonesian government has stated their wish to improve the cooperation with Australia after the executions. Indonesian Foreign Ministry Spokesman Arrmanatha Nasir has also stated following the departure of Australian ambassador for Indonesia, about the interest of Indonesia to resolve the cooperation and move on from the past conflict.\textsuperscript{22}

This thesis would like to examine the role of Indonesia to increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia after the case through indirect engagement and the result of this engagement by Indonesia.

1.3. Research Question

1.3.1 How did Indonesia engage Australia after the Bali Nine case in order to increase the Australian tourists to Indonesia?

This question will examine about how Indonesia engaged towards Australia after the case to re-attract and to regain the trust of Australian tourists in order for them to come to Indonesia.


1.4. Objective of Research

To analyze the actions taken by Indonesia to engage with Australia after the case to re-attract and to regain the trust of Australian tourists.

1.5. Significance of Research

This research aims to show if the indirect engagement between Australia and Indonesia has met the interest of Indonesia.

1.6. Theoretical Framework

1.6.1. International Cooperation

For international cooperation, according to Robert Keohane, cooperation is defined as “when actors adjust their behavior to the actual or anticipated preferences of others, through a process of policy coordination”. Keohane also stated that cooperation “requires the actions of separate individuals or organizations, which are not in pre-existent harmony, be brought into conformity with one another through a process of negotiation”. According to Koesnadi Kartasasmita, International cooperation is “an obligatory as the consequence of interdependant relationship added with the increasing complexity of the life of human in International community”. International cooperation is divided into two, which are multilateral cooperation and bilateral cooperation.

Interaction between actors is the one factor that allows international cooperation to happen, as it is resulted to the recognition of demands of other state that could be satisfied with more efficient way that could also fulfill the interest of other actors. Then, the fulfillment of the interest of state could be done by also

fulfilling the interest of other state, that assumes to be the effective way for domestic development of each state.

International cooperation has made two general contributions, which can help to find out what kind of behaviour that can be understood as cooperation and to decide which cooperation is likely to gain objectives. There are two important elements that creates conception of cooperation. 27 First, the behaviour of each state is implemented to each other to achieve some objectives. The goals of all the actors involved may be different, but can be claimed as rational to both partnering countries. Second, gains or rewards are provided for all actors with different kind for each state but the value of interest of the actors is mutual.

This theory can be connected to this research on how Australia and Indonesia maintain their relationship in tourism sector. This theory will analyze how Indonesia and Australia could maintain its cooperation despite of the running case of Bali Nine and how did they reconcile their bilateral cooperation after the case. It will analyze how Indonesia and Australia as the partnering country could achieve their own goal or interest from the cooperation between each other. It will also analyze how Australia and Indonesia could accept the efforts of each other to reconcile and begin again the cooperation after the Bali Nine case.

1.6.2. Bilateralism

Bilateral cooperation concerns on the relation or policies of cooperation between two parties and has the activities that are concerning political, economic, and security matters between two states.28 In this world where all the states gather, the cooperation is needed in order to reach the interest of each other and to fulfill each other as well. Bilateralism analyzes the improvement of the sets of standards in international community through the agreement between two states. 29 General

custom in international community can also be shaped and redefined through the core values of bilateralism.\(^\text{30}\)

This theory can be connected to this research on how is the dynamic of socio-economic cooperation between Indonesia and Australia, especially in tourism sector. This theory will analyze how Indonesia and Australia could maintain its bilateral cooperation despite of the running case of Bali Nine and how did they reconcile their bilateral cooperation after the case. It will analyze how Indonesia could maintain its standard of policy to not only suit the interest of itself but also Australia as the partnering country. It will also analyze how Australia could accept the efforts of Indonesia to reconcile and begin again the cooperation after the Bali Nine case.

1.6.3. Engagement

According to Mel Gurtov, engagement is a process of creating the space of improving relationship, that involves reaching out to other actors in many ways that may create new directions for policy that benefit both the engaging state or the engaged one. The objectives are to decrease tensions and to establish a cooperative and mutually beneficial relationship with the means of respecting the leader of the opposed state, giving sureness of security from threat, and providing an opportunity to benefit from the changed relationship through “sufficient and credible” inducements. Rather than an act of charity, engagement is an act that expects benefits.\(^\text{31}\)

According to Richard Haas and Meghan O’Sullivan, quoted by Jakštaitė, engagement is the stipulated condition of incentives for a particular state in order to shape its behaviour in the desired direction. Jakštaitė also divided engagement in bilateral relations between states into four approaches, which are hawk engagement, realistic engagement, economic engagement, and unconditional and conditional engagement. Hawk engagement is described to be tough and


exploratory approach, as it is deemed strict towards the target of the state and does not assume that the target would completely change its foreign policy. Realistic engagement is described to be having a realistic approach with the development of negotiation with a target country and having well-calculated expectations on the realization of the engagement, with defined rules and strict time frames to implement the requirements for the target countries.\textsuperscript{32}

Economic engagement focuses on economic tools of foreign policy with the main interest of the nation being security. It is a policy where economic relations are developed with the partnering state in order to change the behaviour of the targeted state and improve bilateral relations. It recommends that the engaging state approaches the targeted state in the international community and modify the current foreign policy of the target state that prevent possibility of it hurting the interest of the target state and make it a potential enemy. Lastly, conditional and unconditional engagement, where conditional engagement is the type of intergovernmental relations where the target is offered incentives for some specific changes by targeted state in its domestic and foreign policy, while unconditional engagement is a less binding engagement as incentives for the target state are offered without any expectation in return. Both approaches includes a range of instruments, which are economic, political and cultural incentives in order to change the behaviour of the target state in the interest of the engaging state.\textsuperscript{33}


In this globalization era, states have only two options, which is to adjust or to perish, because of the revolution in communication technology that is no longer limited and tearing down the hierarchical social structures and information lacking. Engagement is an important role taken by the state governments in order to maintain its cooperation with another state to fulfill their own interest. Even though they do not completely digest the meaning of the engagement itself, they still creating the sense of awareness towards the national interest of other states in the form of negotiations.\textsuperscript{34}

This theory then can be connected to this research where Indonesia and Australia is the two cooperating country that faced conflict over the death penalty of two Australian drug criminals. The engagement between each other is needed in order two improve the bilateral relationship. Indonesia has the interest of expanding their tourism sector under the presidency of Joko Widodo. In 2015, which is when the case took place, Indonesia suffered a slight decrease of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia. Therefore, some act has been made and/or changed by Indonesian government in order to stabilize the number of Australian tourists to keep increasing. Australia also thinks that the bilateral

relationship with Indonesia is too important to be restrained by the conflict that has already occurred and eventually decided to improve the cooperation and re-engage with Indonesia.

1.7. Scope and Limitations of the Study

As the chosen case study is the indirect engagement of Indonesia towards Australia after the Bali Nine case to increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia, the researcher will explain briefly about the case of Bali Nine and how both countries dealt with this case. This explanation will connect the reader to what was happening on the case and what is the outcome of the case related to the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia.

In this research, to examine the indirect engagement of Indonesia towards Australia to increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia, the researcher will be focused on the cultural incentives engagement. This engagement is part of conditional and unconditional engagement described by Jackstaite, where in the case between Indonesia and Australia, will be focusing on the people-to-people links.

The indirect engagement will be explained starting from the year of the execution, which is 2015, where the decrease of Australian tourists to Indonesia took place caused by the execution, until a year after the execution, which is 2016, where the indirect engagement from Indonesian government towards Australia to increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia began to gain positive result. In the end, the researcher will examine the result of the effort of Indonesian government to engage Australia to attract the Australian tourists to come to Indonesia and improve its tourism sector in 2016.

1.8. Thesis Structure

1.8.1. Chapter I – Introduction

This chapter is the introduction of the case study by the researcher. Written in this chapter are the background of the study, problem identification, research question, objective and significance of research, theoretical framework,
scope and limitation of the study and thesis structure. This chapter gives brief explanation of the topic and provide the question and the objective that would like to be achieve in this research. This chapter would have clear understanding about what would be explained in this thesis.

1.8.2. Chapter II – Literature Review

This chapter contains the review of the literatures that are used by the researcher in this topic research. The literature includes books, journals, and reports that help the researcher in doing the research for the thesis. These literatures also being the prime reference for the researcher to examine this research and finding the result of the research.

1.8.3. Chapter III – Theoretical Framework

This chapter explains about the method of research that is being used by the researcher in creating this research. This chapter also explains about the relations of the theories that form the research as a whole. Lastly, this chapter explains about the tools or references that are used to complete this research, which are books, journals, reports, and others.


This chapter will provide the discussion of the topic research about the cooperation between Indonesia and Australia, especially in tourism sector and how the cooperation is also affected by the Bali Nine case. This chapter explains the timeline of Bali Nine case and how the society of Indonesia and Australia reacted to this case and eventually affected their cooperation in tourism sector.

1.8.5. Chapter V - The Engagement between Indonesia And Australia After The Case of Bali Nine

This chapter will provide the analysis of engagement between Indonesia and Australia after the case of Bali Nine in order to improve Indonesian tourism sector. The research will be divided into two, which are the engagement in year
2015 and engagement in year 2016, to emphasize the difference that the engagement made in each year and eventually giving the result of the research topic.

1.8.6. Chapter VI – Conclusion

This chapter will be the final chapter of the research where it explains the conclusion of the research by answering the research question from the first chapter that is compiled from the explanation of the case and the analysis of engagement that is done by Indonesia towards Australia in order to improve its tourism sector.
CHAPTER II
LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Fink, literature review is a method for identifying and evaluating the work of scholars, researchers and practitioners in a systematic way.\(^{35}\) In this literature review, the writer will provide an overview, description and a summary of the sources that includes books, journals, and scholarly articles that are relevant to the topic of the research. The researcher used these literatures as guidance and reference during the process of writing this thesis.

2.1. After hegemony : Cooperation and Discord in the World Political Economy by Robert O. Keohane.\(^{36}\)

This book is written by Robert O. Keohane, discusses about how Keohane connecting his argument about international regimes to the question about cooperation after hegemony and the dialogue between institutionalist and realist. It also discusses about the occurrence of international cooperation among the states that could gain mutual interests to each other. In here, Keohane puts aside the realist hegemonic theory about states only consumes power and interest for themselves and give less effort on cooperation, rather by enhancing cooperation by fulfilling the interest of others to fulfill self interests. This book suggests that when there are mutual interests, cooperation between states occurs even among purely self-interested states.

The theory that is presented in this book could be related to any situation in political world where states have common interests that can only be gained through cooperation. Aside from that, there will be always conflicts that come


through the relationship that would mainly be caused by conflicting interests. In this book stated that “building information-rich institutions is as important in relations among the superpowers, where confidence is a key variable, and in arms control negotiations, in which monitoring and verification are of great importance, as in managing political-economic relations among the advanced industrialized countries”.

This book will contribute to the article of how Indonesia could maintain its cooperation with Australia amid the conflict that they faced through Bali Nine case. Indonesia and Australia are two different countries, whether in language, economic, social, culture, and many other aspects. However, with such differenciations they still could fulfill each other on their own common interests.

2.2. International Theories of Cooperation among Nations: Strengths and Weaknesses Review Article by Helen Milner.37

This article is written by Helen Milner, taken from World Politics journal, discusses about the theories of cooperation among nations, along with its strenghts and weaknesses. This article explains about the general concept of international cooperation. This article stated that international cooperation has made two general contributions, which can help to find out what behaviour can be stated as cooperation and to decide which cooperation is likely to fulfill the interest of each other. There are two important elements that creates conception of cooperation. First, the behaviour of each state is implemented to each other to achieve some objectives. The goals of all the actors involved may be different, but can be claimed as rational to both partnering countries. Second, gains or rewards are provided for all actors with different kind for each state but the value of interest of the actors is mutual.

This article expalain the strengths and weaknesses of international cooperation. On strengths point, it recognizes the systemic conditions where collaboration may be promoted if the conditions allow states to interact

reciprocally and achieve mutual gains in negotiations. This condition can be possible to allow cooperation and reaching agreement. On weakness point, the authors of the reviewed article gives two weaknesses, which are anarchy and a systematic neglect of domestic factors.

This article contributes to this research on the explanation of the running cooperation between Indonesia and Australia. The cooperation between both state is benefitting yet unfreed from problems. Like the strength point taken from the article, the cooperation of Indonesia and Australia gains benefit towards each other. There are many agreements have been created in order to enhance their cooperation for mutual benefits. Meanwhile, like the weakness point as well, Indonesia and Australia would likely face some issues on their running cooperation, where in Bali Nine case, it is started with the domestic factors of Indonesia.

2.3. Multilateralism, Bilateralism, and Unilateralism in Foreign Policy by Atsushi Tago.

This article is written by Atsushi Tago, taken from Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics, explains about the theories of multilateralism, bilateralism and unilateralism in foreign policy. The article explains about the definition about multilateralism, bilateralism, and unilateralism, and explains about how to understand each of the three theories in foreign policy. It also introduces some evidence-based research that is recently being acknowledged on how the three theories are chosen in a particular foreign policy area such as the formation of alliance, mediation, and international aid. Beside that, it also covers how scholars frame the research questions in each issue and analyzes if there are similarities or differences in research methods, data, and theoretical framework.

This article contributes to this research on how Australia and Indonesia maintained their bilateral relationship despite the running case of Bali Nine. The article can also be related on how Indonesia and Australia could maintain its

---

standard of policy suit the interest of each other despite of many issues being faced by both countries because of many differentiation that each other has.

2.4. Containment and Engagement as Middle-Range Theories by Gerda Jakštaite.39

This article is written by Gerda Jakštaite, taken from Baltic Journal of Law and Politic, discusses about containment and engagement as strategies of foreign policy. It seeks to determine containment and engagement as middle-range theories since they are the theories of power balancing that analyze the phenomenon from a point of view, which is individual approaches to the instruments, regions, targets. The theories comprise a wide scope of understanding and stay within the field of analysis of power balancing. The researcher here takes the material about engagement in order to relate it to the research topic.

According to Richard Haas and Meghan O’Sullivan, quoted by Jakštaite, engagement is the stipulated condition of incentives for a particular state in order to create its behaviour in the desired direction. Jakštaite divided engagement in bilateral relations between states into four approaches, which are hawk engagement, realistic engagement, economic engagement, and unconditional and conditional engagement. Each of the approaches has different way of approach, depends on the many situation of the states.

This article could contribute to this research of how Australia and Indonesia engage to each other in order to reconcile after the Bali Nine case complication. From the four approaches given by the author of the article, the approaches that most likely to suit the relationship between Australia and Indonesia are economic engagement where it recommends that the engaging state approaches the target state in the international community and modify the current foreign policy of the target state to prevent it from hurting the interest of the partnered state and create a potential enemy. And then, conditional and unconditional engagement, where

conditional engagement is the type of intergovernmental relations where the target is offered incentives for some specific changes by targeted state in its domestic and foreign policy.

2.5. Australia’s Relations with Indonesia: Progress despite economic and socio-cultural contraints? By Christopher B. Roberts and Ahmad D. Habir.40

This article from National Security College Issue Brief journal talks about discussion regarding the current affairs in the relationship between Indonesia and Australia and the key challenges to address in the future which focuses on political and security sphere, analysis on how any associated progress is supported by socio-cultural and economic links, and lastly the examination of future policy between both countries.

The article found out that the past issues that had happened between Indonesia and Australia could constraint the relationship between both of them in many aspects, therefore, the two governments will need to be aware of any statement that could offend each other, easy to be misinterpreted or hijacked by domestic politics. The needs to set up perception and attitudes of both countries also needed in order to avoid the constraint. By increasing the focus to develop the economic and socio-cultural spheres of interaction will also encourage the political-security and military dimensions of the relationship. In conclusion, both countries should be cooperative towards each other to meet the interest of each other, or one side could be highly dependance towards the other.

From the opinion of the writer, the writers of the journal clearly stated about the interdependancy between Australia and Indonesia in many aspects, especially in political-economy and socio-cultural aspect. Indonesia with its developing economy and huge population that make the economy activity even more developed, makes it as one of the most beneficial country for Australia to cooperate with, especially when geographically Indonesia is the only big country that is located near Australia. Australia also has a beneficial role in developing the

economy of Indonesia. Therefore, despite of many issues that happened between both countries, including the execution of Australian drug smugglers in Indonesia, both countries should then understand both interests and finding ways to avoid similar things that could constrain the relationship between both countries to be happened again.

2.6. Dinamika Hubungan Bilateral Indonesia-Australia Pascahukuman Mati Chan dan Sukumaran by Lisbet.\(^41\)

This article from the journal of *Info Singkat Hubungan Internasional* (Short Information of International Relations) explains about the dynamic of bilateral relation between Indonesia and Australia after the execution of Australian drug smugglers, Chan and Sukumaran. This article explains from both perspectives, which are from Indonesian perspective and Australian perspective. While Australia was trying hard to influence Indonesia to not conduct the execution for the sake of the security of its citizens, Indonesia thinks that it is a rightful thing to do in order to secure its security and sovereignty as a state whom it is had to face the attack of narcotism in the country.

As the conclusion, despite many protests from Australia and several countries and NGOs, Indonesia still has the right to conduct its sovereignty without foreign intervention. Moreover, this act by Indonesian government was in order to fight against the drug issues that are getting higher in the country. Still, Indonesia understood about the Australian government reaction towards its act, however, Indonesian government assure that sooner or later, both countries has to make the conditions up and build cooperation again as both countries has the interdependency towards each other.

The researcher does agree with the conclusion of the article. Nevertheless, the crime was happening in Indonesia that was conducted by foreign criminals, which are Australia. Indonesia has its right to conduct its own rules of the state because it is endangered the security of the nation. However,

\(^41\) Lisbet. (2015). *DINAMIKA HUBUNGAN BILATERAL INDONESIA-AUSTRALIA PASCAHUKUMAN MATI CHAN DAN SUKUMARAN.* Info Singkat Hubungan Internasional, 7(9), 5-8. doi:ISSN 2088-2351
then, how much hate and protests that were sent by Australian government towards the act of Indonesian government, Australia still need to cooperate with Indonesia in many aspects, especially in political-economic aspect and eventually, both countries should move on from the issues that has been passed and build again cooperation with each others.

2.7. Balancing Abolitionism and Cooperation on The World’s Scale : The Case of The Bali Nine by Ronli Sifiris.42

The article from the journal of Federal Law Review considers the potential conflict that may emerge when a state is committed to both international criminal cooperation as well as death penalty abolition and assumes the view that these obligations can be and must be reconciled and it invokes as to the cases of Bali Nine, where Australia provided Indonesia with information regarding heroin trafficking from Indonesia to Australia by Australian citizens. The article is also explaining about the consideration of legal position of Australia related to the commitment of Australia in death penalty abolition and also its relationship with Indonesia in international criminal cooperation. And then, the article explain how both obligations could be resolved in international arena. Lastly, the author concludes that although both obligations seemly to against each other, there is evidence that both obligations could be fulfilled.

By prioritising its relationship with Indonesia above its commitment to death penalty abolition, Australia’s actions in the case of the Bali Nine are inconsistent with its obligations under the ICCPR and are at variance with the growing practice of states to reconcile commitment to death penalty abolition with commitment to international relations such that both commitments are respected. This failure to reconcile international obligations has the potential to contribute to the problem of fragmentation in international law.

In the opinion of researcher, Australia might had to face such dilemma whether it has to be committed with its death penalty abolition according

to the obligations under the ICCPR while it is also cannot defend the act of Indonesian government to conduct such act. Whereas, Australia has fulfill its obligation in International Criminal cooperation by informing the Indonesian government regarding the drug smugglers in Indonesia at the first place.

2.8. Connecting Australia and Indonesia by Asia Society Australia.\textsuperscript{43}

This article discusses about further cooperation that Indonesia and Australia could possibly be engaged and many prospects that they could achieve in the future after the case of Bali Nine. Strong economic growth, supported by a massive labour supply, emerging middle class, high online and mobile using and a political climate that is good for business, have putted Indonesia to become one of the biggest emerging economic growth in the future. The important thing that has to be improved is that both countries could strengthen their efforts in improving knowledge and reducing suspicion towards each other.

However, despite of all the prospects and capabilities own by Indonesia, there are many challenges that would still have to be faced by Indonesian government, one of them is political relationship with Australia especially in the wake of Bali Nine executions. Then, the bilateral relationship between both countries have to keep solid because they need each other in order to develop their country, even, in the article stated that Indonesia is more important to Australia than Australia is to Indonesia. This article suggests the needs of Australia to be more focused on Southeast Asia country, especially Indonesia.

This article will be related to the this research on how Australia, after the case of Bali Nine, is willing to engage back with Indonesia to re-strengthen their bilateral relationship. This article show that not only Indonesia that is in need of Australia and also its aid, but there are also many aspects that Australia is lacking and very much in need of Indonesia to fulfill those lacking aspect, such as in the case of live cattle export ban where Australia banned the export of live cattle from Indonesia and causing many Australian farmers to suffer from

\textsuperscript{43} Asia Society Australia, “Connecting Australia and Indonesia,” Insights May 25, 2015.
declining business and even went bankrupt. The article underlines the fact that Australia “need to be genuinely and continuously engaged – not just in a rhetorical sense or in going through the motions – with our very large neighbour of increasing regional and global importance.” It will be related on how Indonesia, after putting two Australian citizens in the death row, wants to engage to Australia for a better relationship, especially in socio-economic sector, after a restrained relationship amid the case.

2.9. Potensi Wisata Olah Raga dalam Meningkatkan Kunjungan Wisatawan by Marhanani Tri Astuti.44

This article explains about the potential way to increase tourist arrival in Indonesia, which is by sport tourism. Here the writer mentions several international sport events held by Indonesia in order to attract many tourist to join the event and come to Indonesia, such as Jakarta Marathon, Tour de Singkarak, International Tour de Banyuwangi Ijen, Bali Race and Rally 2015, and so on. This article stated that the improvement of Indonesian tourism image through sport tourism has the potential to improve the community involvement. That way it could increase the global competitiveness and foreign exchange.

The role of sport tourism in tourism sector development gives postive outcome in the time spent by tourists on their visit and also the number of tourists also affects in many sector such as the economy, transportation service and tourism industry. In this article, the writer mentioned about the aim of Bali Race and Rally 2015 event that invited many Australian to participate in the event, which is to promote nautical tourism and increase the image of tourism of Indonesia to the world, and also strengthen bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Australia with the expected 500 tourists, including Australians, participate in this event.

This article would be related to this research with the explanation about Bali Race and Rally 2015, where aside of its aim to promote nautical tourism and

increase the image of tourism of Indonesia to the world, it is also to strengthen its bilateral relationship with Australia, as the event is a collaboration between the Fremantle Sailing Club of Australia with Indonesian Ministry of Tourism. As stated from the article, sport tourism could help in strengthening the coordination and partnering between government and private sector. It is also become a reconciliatory act from Indonesia after the occurrence of Bali Nine case to keep up the cooperation with Australia.

---

CHAPTER III
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1. Research Method

According to Suryana, research methodology is a systematic procedure or steps in order to gain knowledge. By doing a research, we can gain more knowledge that are needed for academical purpose and/or for the sake of the intelligence of individuals. Research can resulted to a discovery of knowledge that is unknown before by the researcher, that would enrich the knowledge of researcher about the topic and create a better comprehension.

The methodology is used to explain the reason of the research being conducted and also a way to solve the research questions systematically. In international relations, the interaction between states, societies, and organizations are being studied, therefore it requires a more orderly approach to examine the processes and changes.

This research will be an explanatory research. According to Anol Bhattacherjee, the purpose of explanatory research is to search for explanations of the observed phenomenon, problems or behaviors and it is often implemented in new areas of inquiry, where the goals the research are: (1) to scope out the prominence of a particular phenomenon, problem or behavior, (2) to generate some initial ideas regarding it. This type of research also aims to interpret

---

beyond the existing facts in order to explain the elements that is included in the topic deeply.\textsuperscript{49}

Following his book of *Social Science Research: Principles, Methods, and Practices*, this research will be conducted in qualitative approach. According to Anol, qualitative analysis depends on the analysis and integrative skill of the researcher, and personal knowledge of the social context where the data is collected.\textsuperscript{50} The collection of data can be done through the combination of individual observation, interviews, internal and external documents. However, during this research, it will be based on the internal or external documents and rely on the ability of researcher in formulating his way of thinking from personal observation.

Qualitative approach consists of an investigation that seeks answers to a question, systematically uses a predefined set of procedures to answer the question, collects evidence, produces findings that were not determined in advance and that are applicable beyond the immediate boundaries of the study.\textsuperscript{51} The advantage of using this method is the ability to discover social varieties, factors of political and cultural that can be connected to the phenomena that might be obtrusive in previous time. This method is considered best in aligning with the objective of this study which is *explanatory research*.

### 3.1.1. Method of Data Collection

The researcher collects sources in the form of official documents, official statements, transcript of interview with the officials and/or scholars, academic journals, and news articles that are related to the case research. The news articles will work as the supporting data for the official sources that have been gotten. The qualities from this method are the sources are reliable as they are gotten from the officials and supported by the scholars as well.


\textsuperscript{50} Bhattacherjee, A. (2012). *Social science research: principles, methods, and practices*. Tampa, Florida: University of South Florida.

\textsuperscript{51} FAMILY HEALTH INTERNATIONAL. (n.d.). Qualitative Research Methods: A Data Collector’s Field Guide.
3.2. **Research Framework**

The diplomatic act is an important aspect to be done by the leaders of the state in order to secure the relationship of the state with another state who it cooperates with. Surely, between the state there must be some obstacles on their path of cooperation, conflicting in interest and such. However, a cooperation is still needed in order to fulfill the needs and interest of the state itself. Cooperation basically should lead to rewards for all states, even though it is not necessarily the same or mutual rewards, but all parties should get benefit from it. Both Indonesia and Australia need each other and benefitting as neighbouring countries. If the cooperation between both states should be constrained by a single case, there are much things to lose for both of the state.

In order to revive the constrained cooperation, one should engage to another party by adjusting their behavior towards the engaged party by coordinating policy that would suits the interest of each other through a process of negotiation. The reward would certainly benefitted the opposed state and the consiliator state as well. This goes aligned with the research of conciliation of Australia and Indonesia after the case of Bali Nine capital punishment, in terms of re-attract the Australian tourism to Indonesia. To give a better understanding on how this thesis elaborate the chosen topic shown in the below figure.

---

This research has put its focus on the role of Indonesia to engage to Australia after the case had occurred, in order to gain interests of reviving number of Australian tourists to Indonesia from the partnering state which is Australia that is against the death penalty to be occured to its citizens. The writer believed that in order to give a proper analysis towards this matter is by putting and combine several theories within this research. The writer will use international cooperation and bilateralism to analyze the cooperation between Indonesia and Australia when the case was running, when the capital punishment was given to Australian drug smugglers, and after the case. Furthermore, as the cooperation between Indonesia and Australia got restrained because of the case, specifically in tourism sector of Indonesia, this research will connect a concept which is engagement to gain more
understanding about how Indonesia and Australia regain their cooperation and trust after the case.

3.3. Research Instruments

- **Books**
  Books are the most reliable source for a research as it has been published everywhere and last longer than common articles. The informations gotten from the book are deemed to be more accurate than what is gotten from mere articles, especially that are published widely on the internet. In this thesis, the researcher uses ten books. There are four books that are used as the source of theories of international cooperation, bilateralism, and engagement. The researcher also uses three books regarding human rights and death penalty. Beside that, there are three books that are used as the source of knowledge of general application of literature review and research framework.

- **Journals**
  Journals that contains academic articles by scholars or academician that are relevant to the topic are important as they will provide the researcher with the point of view of many scholars regarding the chosen topic. This point of view of scholars then will be the tools for the researcher to be compared with the chosen topic. In this thesis, there are 17 journals used for this research, include the domestic ones and international ones. The journals that are being used are regarding the theories related to the topic and the case that is being the topic of the thesis.

- **Reports**
  Governmental reports are taken to be contributed on this research. From governmental reports we can take an official data from government, which the reliability cannot be doubted as it coming officially from the government. The governmental reports are also
essential as it contains crucial information and data regarding the chosen topic of research. In this thesis, the reports are coming from Indonesian Ministry of Tourism, Australian Ministry of Tourism, Asia Society Australia and Lowy Institute.

- **Articles**
  Articles from scholars and government that are relevant to the topic are also important as it could give insight of the case and a better understanding of the theories. In this thesis, the articles that are related to the topic are retrieved from governmental websites which are Australian Embassy Indonesia website, Badan Pusat Statistik or Central Bureau of Statistics website, Australian Foreign Minister website, Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade website, Indonesian Foreign Ministry, Australian Parliament website, Indonesian Secretariat of the Cabinet website, and Consulate General of The Republic of Indonesia in Perth website. Indonesian newspapers which are Kompas, Kabar Timur, Sindonews, Pontianak Post and Foreign newspapers which is The Straits Times; and Indonesian magazines, which are Tempo and Warta Bea Cukai.

- **Internet**
  The use of internet in this modern era is no longer unfamiliar and undoubtedly inseparable from the life of human. With its ease of using, it is become a reliable source to find datas that are needed for the research. The benefit of searching via internet is to help the researcher on finding some datas, information, articles, and books that are not available in the country of the researcher and/or is difficult to be obtained anywhere, such as official information from another country. With the existence of internet, it would be easier to get access on any available official resources or scholarly book and articles online. The sources taken from the internet that are being used are the books and journals that have been mentioned
above, international treaties, government publications, reports, transcripts of speeches and interviews of the government, and news articles from online medias which are Australian Broadcasting Corporation or ABC, CNN, The Diplomat, Antara News, The Guardian, IBTimes, Berita Satu, Radio Australia, Sidney Morning Herald or SMH, BBC, and Weekly Times Now.
CHAPTER IV

BALI NINE CASE AND INDONESIA-AUSTRALIA TOURISM COOPERATION AMID THE CASE

(2005-2014)

Indonesia and Australia share a close bilateral relationship through the cooperation that is going stronger each year, not to forget also the geographic proximity and the mutual in interests for a peaceful and stable region. Both countries have been known to work on solving shared problem together, including environmental issues, security issues, transnational crimes, and so on and so forth. Indonesia is noted by Australia as one of the important strategic partner, considering from its strategic position, huge population, and fast-growing economy as one of the main world power and also as the leading country of Southeast Asia that has global influence and growing role in international forum.53

Australia is also important for Indonesia with its contribution on the development of Indonesia in many aspects, such as infrastructure, health, education, and tourism.54

The relationship between Indonesia and Australia is relatively unique, as both of the countries provide promising chances for cooperation yet not free from many challenges. This condition caused by many differentiation between both countries regarding cultural and also political interests. The former Australian Foreign Minister Gareth Evans also stated “no two neighbors anywhere in the world are as comprehensively unlike as Australia and Indonesia. We differ in language, culture, religion, history, ethnicity, population size and in political, legal

However, despite of many challenges, both countries still manage to maintain their relationship for further cooperation that benefited each other.

4.1. History of Bilateral Cooperation

The history of the cooperation between Indonesia and Australia begins from the time Indonesia gained its independence in 1945. Australia saw the newly independant country as likely to be important for the future of Australia as well. Australia threw its support behind the revolutionary movement and opposed Dutch efforts to resume colonial control, by bringing the struggle to the attention of the UN Security Council in July 1847 and represented the new state of Indonesia on a “Good Offices Commission”. Herbert Evatt, Minister for External Affairs of Australia, noted to Prime Minister Chifley in late 1945 that Australia hoped to see “the beginning in South Eastern Asia and Indonesia of a cooperative group of self reliant states linked with other States of the world by ties of trade, legitimate investments and political cooperation and Mutual Aid."

Diplomatic relationship between Indonesia and Australia was officialy opened in 1949 and Indonesia fully opened the diplomatic relationship on 17 March 1950 with Dr. Oesman Sastroamidjojo as the Affairs ad interim and then replaced by Oetojo Ramelan as the Ambassador. After going on the nomadic period, in August 1971, Indonesian Representative Office finaly reside in the area in Yarralumla, which is the area of foreign representatives residents in Canberra.

Along the years of cooperation, there are indeed many challenges that were caused by differentiation between both countries. As stated by the former

---

Australian Prime Minister Gareth Evans, “no two neighbors anywhere in the world are as comprehensively unlike as Australia and Indonesia. We differ in language, culture, religion, history, ethnicity, population size and in political, legal and social systems.”

Major challenges that happened between both countries, such as dispute of West Irian and East Timor showed the conflicting interest between Australia and Indonesia. However, as both countries needed each other by geographic proximity, it is important for them to step aside and move on from any conflicts. Australia has a clear national interest where if Southeast Asia can maintain its prosperous peaceful and secure state, then it will affect Australia as well. The same goes if Southeast Asia caught in a downturn situation. Therefore, both countries cooperate to resolve common problems and has long been aware with the benefits of supporting regional processes for promoting peace and economic growth.

4.2. Bilateral Relations between Australia and Indonesia (2005-2014)

Indonesia and Australia has developed a close bilateral relationship through the cooperation since the time Indonesia got its independance, and it goes reciprocal for both countries. Both of the countries enjoy cooperation in many aspects, which are political, economic, security, development, education and people-to-people ties. On their bilateral relationship, both countries actively hold a series of regular high-level meetings to discuss about the aspects of cooperation that have been mentioned above.

---


4.2.1. Political Cooperation

Bilateral cooperation with Indonesia is the most important, complex and challenging for Australia.\(^{62}\) Although it is undoubtedly true that cooperation in this aspect has met a lot of challenges caused by several issues in the past and present, such as dispute on East-Timor and West Papua, the spying scandal by Australian government towards Indonesian government, and drug crime that ended to the death penalty of two Australians by the law of Indonesia and restrain some major cooperations between both countries.

However, despite of those conflicts, both countries always manage to get away from it and resolve the cooperation between both of them. The leaders of both countries manage the bilateral relationship by a series of regular high-level meetings that include the Meeting of Indonesia-Australia Annual Leaders, 2+2 Dialogue of the Foreign and Defence Minister, the Meeting of Trade Minister and the Ministerial Council on Law and Security.\(^{63}\) These meetings are the efforts of both countries to maintain and to develop the political ties on many aspects that the countries have cooperation in. Agreements such as Joint Declaration on Comprehensive Partnership also made to as a roadmap for the development of bilateral relations between Indonesia and Australia.

On security cooperation, both countries have comprehensive agreement to work together to enhance counter-terrorism cooperation. Lombok Treaty are the results of the commitment of both countries to enhance security cooperation. Lombok Treaty is implemented in order to share the goal of peace, security and prosperity in the region and to continue the close cooperation on matters that affect the security of both countries. The agreement was setted to strengthen further cooperation in combating terrorism and other forms of transnational crime and non-traditional security threats such as people smuggling, narcotics, money

laundering, aviation and maritime security, and outbreaks of disease.\textsuperscript{64} Other agreements relating to the issues stated on Lombok Treaty were further discussed on Joint Statements between the leaders of both countries.

Terrorism attack is one of the major problems that is faced by both countries. Bali bombings are one of the tragedies that affected negatively on both countries, where it claimed many casualties of Indonesians and other foreign tourists, especially the biggest casualty was suffered by the Australian tourists. The Bali Bombings also hampered the economy activities in Bali, as it decreased the number of tourists coming to Bali. Cooperation in this matter between Indonesia and Australia was the forming of Joint Investigation and Intelligence Team to investigate the Bali Bombings that were happened in 2002 and 2005 that involves law enforcement officials from Australia and Indonesia.\textsuperscript{65} This joint effort is done in order to secure the environment of Bali from another terrorist attack that could took many lives of the tourists, especially Australian, and avoided Indonesia from economic harm caused by the tragedy.

Australia is also the state with the biggest ODA given to Indonesia.\textsuperscript{66} As Indonesia is the closest country partner to Australia, the geographical proximity makes Indonesia to be having important geopolitical and strategic role in Australia, in which sustainable and inclusive economic growth in Indonesia will also benefits Australia and contributes to the growth and stability of the country.\textsuperscript{67}

From the explanations above, Indonesia and Australia bilateral relations is such an important thing because the condition of each other would likely be affecting each other as well. Although the challenges and obstacles were

\textsuperscript{66} Ibid.
undoubtedly be faced by both countries for their differentiations, both countries always have ways to reconcile and maintain the cooperation.

### 4.2.2. Economic Cooperation

Australia has many opportunity in expanding its trade, investment and economic cooperation with Indonesia, where Indonesia is placed 16th rank in the largest economy in the world.\(^{68}\) Indonesia is only rank 13th in trade partner of Australia, however Indonesia is the leader among other Southeast Asian countries and one of the founding father of ASEAN, which is important for Australia if it wants to maintain connection with other ASEAN countries.\(^{69}\)

The two-way trade between Australia and Indonesia in 2015 was worth AUS$ 15.3 billion, with agricultural products as the key sources exports to Indonesia from Australia, and crude petroleum and manufactured goods as the key imports from Indonesia.\(^{70}\) This two-way trade is also not free from obstacles. Take the example of Australian live export cattle ban to Indonesia in 2011 that was caused by animal harming by Indonesian farmers. This ban was severely hurting the economy as stated by the Association chief executive of Northern Territory Cattleman Tracey Hayes that, “Indonesia was the only market option available to producers in the north for the type of cattle that are produced up here (Australia)”.\(^{71}\) Because of this ban, the majority of Australian farmers were suffered from bankruptcy. The problem was finally solved by the end of the year where Australian government cuts the export ban.\(^{72}\)

---


Australia and Indonesia negotiates on several trade agreements, which are Indonesia-Australia Comprehensive Economic Partnership Agreement (IA-CEPA), ASEAN-Australia-New Zealand Free Trade Agreement, Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership, and Trans-Pacific Partnership. Those agreements will create the framework for a closer economic engagement between the two countries and open new markets and opportunities for businesses, primary producers, service providers and investors. The Working Groups under the Australia-Indonesia Ministerial Forum (AIMF) also works on implementing the provisions of Trade Investment Framework (TIF), which goals are to enhance cooperation on trade, investment and business climate matters; comprehensive dialogue of policy on economic and investment climate matters; taking part in the facilitation of trade and investment by hindrance minimization, promoting transparency in regulations and reducing costs; promoting business competitiveness; and strengthen capacity building and bilateral technical assistance in trade, investment policy, and economic governance.73

In tourism sector, as of 2014, Australian tourists contributed to Rp 18 billion or same value as AUS$ 1,8 million to Indonesian economy.74 Australia is rank fourth among the largest contributors in tourism sector of Indonesia after Singapore, Malaysia, and China.75 One of the main tourism destination that is favoured by Australians is Bali, where they usually refer it as their ‘second home’, as it is very common for Australians to go to Bali for their leisure time.

4.2.3. People-to-People Links.

People-to-people links is also an important aspect from Australia in its bilateral relationship with Indonesia. This aspect has goals to enhance the mutual understanding between the people and communities of the two countries through cultural, sporting and educational engagement and tourism. Majority of

Australians would choose Indonesia, especially Bali, for their favourite holiday destination even as their “second home”, for its beauty and cultural diversity that Bali offers. Indonesian tourists also make significant holiday visits to Australia. Majority of Indonesian would like to come to Australia because of its safety and security, world class nature, aquatic and coastal, good infrastructure, and friendly and open citizens.\textsuperscript{76} Paul Grigson, Australian ambassador for Indonesia also encourage the Australians to not only visit Bali for their holiday but also another big cities or islands of Indonesia.

There are three programs that are established by Australia in order to maintain its close relationship with Indonesia. First, Australia-Indonesia Institute (AII), that was established in 1989 by the Australian Government with the objectives to contribute to a more broadly based, enhancing relationship between Australia and Indonesia and to show positive images of Australia and Indonesia in the point of view of each other.\textsuperscript{77} Second, The Australia-Indonesia Centre that is supported through federal funding from Department of Education and Training of Australia and Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, with the support of Indonesian Ministry for Research, Technology and Higher Education that has three core objectives in research (cooperation in pursuing solutions to shared national challenges in areas such as energy, infrastructure, health, urban water, and food & agriculture by highly collaborative research), leadership (cooperation in enhancing networks between Australia-Indonesia, developing leadership skills and fostering knowledge exchange), and insight (cooperation in promoting greater understanding and cultural awareness between each other).\textsuperscript{78} Lastly, The Australian Consortium for ‘In-Country’ Indonesian Studies (ACICIS), which is an innovative, non-profit, national educational consortium that was established in 1994 to overcome the substantial academic, bureaucratic, and immigration

impediments that had prevented Australian students from undertaking credited semester study at Indonesian universities.79

Australia giving aids for more than 17,000 Indonesian college students to study in Australian universities. Australia remains the number one destination for Indonesian students to study overseas with the offer of 600 AIPRD post-graduate scholarships.80 The existence of The New Colombo Plan by Australia for Indonesia also encourages Australian students to study and to apply internship in Indonesia and having the opportunity to study in universities across Indonesia in numerous choice of disciplines. Another educational exchange program is BRIDGE or Building Relations through Intercultural Dialogue and Growing Engagement, that funds visits by Indonesian teachers to Australian schools and supports the development of school e-twinning and an online collaborative curriculum strategy between Australian and Indonesian schools.81

And then, as the bridge for understanding better the culture and identity of each other, many cultural exhibitions and sports events were held in both countries. One of the example of cultural exhibition was held in 2007 Gang Festival, which is a cross-cultural celebration of collaboration between contemporary Indonesian and Australian artists in Sydney and sponsored by Australia-Indonesia Institute.82 And then, in order to promote marine tourism as well, Indonesia hold Sail Indonesia to invite yachts from countries around the world, especially Australia to sail to Indonesia. Australia-Indonesia Youth Exchange Program (AIYEP) also provides opportunities for Indonesian and Australian youth to gain a better understanding of the culture, development and

way of life of the country of each other.\(^{83}\) This program sends 18 young Indonesians to Australia for two months where they take part in work placements, cultural performances, homestays and visits local schools and communities, while 18 young Australians will take the same program in Indonesia.

### 4.3 Bali Nine Case

On 17 April 2005, nine Australian were arrested by Indonesian police, with the help of Australian Federal Police (AFP) who investigated the criminals nine days before the arrest, for attempting to smuggle more than eight kilograms of heroin to the outside of Indonesia.\(^{84}\) At the same time, Martin Stephens, Renae Lawrence, Scott Rush and Michael Czugaj were found at Denpasar airport with packages of heroin strapped to their bodies; Si Yi Chen, Tan Duc Thanh Nguyen and Matthew Norman were arrested at the Melasti Hotel Kuta Beach and Spa in possession of approximately 8.200 grams of heroin; and Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran were arrested at Denpasar airport in relation to those found carrying heroin.\(^{85}\)

Numbers of court trial were done and led to final decision for each of the criminals. Lawrence and Czugaj were sentenced 20 years of jail by the court; Rush, Norman, Chen, Stephens and Nguyen were sentenced to life in prison; Chan and Sukumaran were sentenced to death penalty.\(^{86}\) The results of the sentences appointed to each criminals are also given from the series of clemency pleas and judicial reviews, where some of them were granted punishment reduced and some of them were given punishment induced.

---


\(^{85}\) PUTUSAN No. 38 PK/PID.SUS/2011, 1 (Mahkamah Agung Republik Indonesia 2011).

\(^{86}\) Ibid.
4.3.1. District Court Session

In this session, there were 12 steps occurred in the case. Firstly, the first trial for the convicted was begin on 11 October 2005, and being held for 4 days in a row with the convicted being judged alternately. Eventually, on 13 February 2006, Renae Lawrence and Scott Rush were sentenced to life in prison. On the following day, Chan and Sukumaran were found guilty and sentenced to death by firing squad, and Michael Czugaj and Martin Stephens were sentenced to life imprisonment. And then, the next day Matthew Norman, Si Yi Chen and Tan Duc Thanh Nguyen were sentenced to life in prison. From here, the lawyers of the convicted were actively seeking for clemency for their clients to gain some decreasement towards their sentences.

4.3.2. High Court Session

In this session, there were six processes occurred in the case. The high court session begin on 26 April 2006. The efforts on seeking clemency for the convicted gained results for some of the convicted, as the sentences of Lawrence, Czugaj, Norman, Nguyen and Chen were reduced to 20 years by the court but brought no luck for Chan, Sukumaran, Stephen and Rush as their appeal were rejected by the court. However, on 6 September 2006, the convicted got their sentence increased, with Rush, Nguyen, Chen, and Norman were sentenced to death after prosecutors appealed against their lighter jail sentences and Czugaj had his punishment increased from the reduced 20-year jail to life imprisonment. Following the sentences increasement, the lawyers continued to filed further challenges and appeals.

4.3.3 Supreme Court Session

In this session, there were 31 processes occurred in the case. This session was started on 6 March 2008. Before the supreme court was held for the Bali Nine criminals, Australian Prime Minister Howard, despite of his statement on feeling

88 Ibid.
inappropriate to raise issues about clemencies for the criminals and his respect towards Indonesian court processes on the criminals, on 27 July 2007, eventually raised the issue of the Bali Nine group to Indonesian President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono in their bilateral meeting, as it is also brought many attention in Australia.89

Following the meeting between Prime Minister Howard and President Yudhoyono, on 6 March 2008, the supreme court grant the wishes for judicial review of the Bali Nine criminals, where the death sentences of the three of the death convicted, Nguyen, Chen and Norman were reduced to life in jail by Indonesia Supreme Court.90 Stephen, Chan and Sukumaran requests for lodged judicial review but eventually rejected by the court. On 13 August 2010, Chan and Sukumaran lodged judicial review requests of their death sentence and the second time of this action was done 2 months later. On 26 August 2010, Rush appeared in court for his final appeal, bolstered by a letter from the AFP stating he played only a minor role in the case and eventually got his sentence decrease from death sentence to life imprisonment.91

On 11 May 2011, Rush got his sentence reduced from death sentence to life imprisonment. On 17 July 2011, After two requests of judicial review, Chan and Sukumaran lost judicial review. On May 2012, Chan and Sukumaran plead to Indonesian President Yudhoyono to pardon them from the penalty and resulted to them receiving one year reprieve from their death penalties on December 2012.92

When Indonesian President Joko Widodo rose to presidency, he stated no mercy for the drug criminal, which triggered the Australian government to take action. On 17 January 2015, Australian Prime Minister Tony Abbott appeals

92 Ibid.
directly to Indonesian President Widodo to give mercy for both death sentenced criminals. On 22 January 2015, Plea for clemency from Chan was rejected. Chan and Sukumaran officially filed applications for a judicial review of their cases. On 2 February 2015, Chan and Sukumaran was placed in the next round of execution.\(^{93}\)

On 9 February 2015, the lawyers of both criminals challenged against Indonesian president which ended up being rejected two days later. On 2 March 2015, Chief prosecutor of Bali stated his plan to transfer Chan and Sukumaran out of Bali prison in the next two days in preparation for their executions, but then Chan and Sukumaran were eventually transferred the next day on 3 March to Nusakambangan Island where the death penalty would take place at. The death penalty was delayed from 6 March due to the unfinished legal appeals. Eventually, Chan and Sukumaran were executed by the firing squad on 29 April 2015.\(^{94}\)

4.4. Indonesia and Australia Dealing with the Case

On the first time Bali Nine was caught by Indonesian police officers and courted by the district court, the reaction of Australians, both the government and the citizens at that time were rather submissive as they were agree on the fact that the criminals were all guilty and deserve to be punished as what they had been sentenced to. As the capture itself was supported by the Australian Federal Police (AFP), the act of the AFP themself also got the support from the then prime minister John Howard, which he stated, “The Australian Federal Police took an operational decision and I totally support the Australian Federal Police in that decision”.\(^{95}\) The statement of the Justice Minister Chris Ellison also agreed with the act by the AFP, as the cooperation with the local law enforcement in Indonesia


\(^{94}\) Ibid.

would help in fighting against drugs. Australian media, The Daily Telegraph, also agreed with the act of The AFP and the arrest of Bali Nine, as they putted on a huge headline *No Sympathy: their drug operation would have destroyed thousands of lives – now they’ll pay with theirs.*

With this support from the government and the news distribution from the media that was supporting Indonesia, the Australian citizen were driven to follow on supporting Indonesia in fighting against drug crimes that was caused by their own citizens. As stated by Australian Prime Minister Howard that he and most of the Australians understood and strongly supported the sentences that befell on the Bali Nine criminals, and even warned the Australians to not mess with the laws of other countries. He also stated that it is inappropriate for him to raise issues about clemencies for the criminals as he respected Indonesian court processes towards the criminals.

On high court session, there is no act of engagement from Australian government towards Indonesian government to appeal for the clemency of the prisoners. Indonesian government at that time was also focusing on the state recovery after the Bali Bombing in 2002, as it took many foreign casualties, with Australians as the largest number of casualties, make the number of tourists from many countries in America and Asia-Pacific region had dropped by 20.60 per cent. Followed by the second bombing in Bali that occured in the nearly end of 2005 that took 17 Australian casualties, which decreased the number of Australian tourists significantly. However, by the end of this session in 2007, before the supreme court was held for the Bali Nine criminals, Australian Prime Minister Howard, did raise the issue of the Bali Nine group to Indonesian President Susilo

---

Bambang Yudhoyono in their bilateral meeting, as he was reasoning that it brought many attention in Australia. This bilateral meeting then followed by the decrease of sentence of Nguyen, Chen and Norman from death sentence to life in jail by Indonesia Supreme Court.

As the time goes by since the arrest of the Bali Nine, the criminals were going through self-improvement in their life as prisoners. As informed in the first media interview with Chan and Sukumaran in 2010, both of the criminals had changed to be better persons, with Chan had become a committed Christian and spent majority of his time in prayer or religious study and became a pastor, while Sukumaran ran English and computer lessons that was funded from his art selling along with other prisoners.

On May 2012, Chan and Sukumaran begged to president SBY to pardon them from execution, with the reason of self-improvement throughout their jail time. The fact of self-improvement of both criminals gained sympathy of the Australians and supports toward Chan and Sukumaran began to flow since then. Eventually, on December 2012, Chan and Sukumaran received one year reprieve from their death penalties.

In 2014, when the government of Indonesia changed from the presidency of Yudhoyono to Joko Widodo, the faith of the two death convicted was upheld. On 11 December 2014, President Widodo stated no mercy for the two death convicted who had occured themself in drug crimes. From then, the Australian government began to speak up for the two criminals and also made their efforts in order to freed Chan and Sukumaran from the death row. Many government pleas

---


had been sent to Indonesian government to grant clemency for Chan and Sukumaran. As stated from Australian Foreign Minister, Julie Bishop, the strong opposition Australia towards death penalty at home and abroad is one main cause to seek clemency and work on the death penalty cancellation of the two criminals.\textsuperscript{103} Australian Prime Minister Tony Abott even appealed directly to President Jokowi to give the two criminals mercy and making a way by mentioning tsunami relief in the renewed clemency plea, which provokes resentment from both the government and the people of Indonesia.\textsuperscript{104}

Both criminals were also gained support from the Australian people, where as stated by Julie Bishop, there were more than 30,000 Australians wrote to Indonesian President pleaing for the executions to be halted.\textsuperscript{105} The act by Indonesian government was highly condemned by the Australians as they were sharing their opinion in the social media about the death penalty on their fellow Australians. Many statements of disapproval are posted via social media by most of the Australian and even have made a viral social media campaign #BoycottBali as a form of disapproval. It first appeared in late January 2015 after clemency for both Chan and Sukumaran had been denied by Indonesian president Joko Widodo. An Australian Facebook group account under the name Boycott Bali for the Boys even putted a message that stated:

\begin{quote}
\textit{We merely want the Indonesian government to listen to the Australian people! It will have a lasting impact on the economy of Bali and Indonesia if the goodwill between us is damaged in this way!}
\end{quote}

- Boycott Bali for the Boys Facebook Group Account.

This act was replied by the mutual negative responds from Indonesians as they were on the supporting side of death penalty. One of the responds was “Dear Australians, if you think we prefer tourism than drugs which killed our kids future


\textsuperscript{105} Ibid.
The responds from Indonesian government remained firm on putting the two criminals on the death row. The efforts of legal appeals, however, were indeed delayed the process of execution.

On 5 March 2015, Bishop suggested prisoner swap to Indonesian Foreign minister Retno Marsudi. Australia proposed to switch three Indonesian citizens who were jailed in Australia for a drug crime in return for Chan and Sukumaran. However, the offer also got rejected by Indonesian government and failed to stop the executions. Another effort was being done, which by sending a senior Islamic cleric of Australia to Indonesian capital on 11 March 2015, to plead for the lives of Chan and Sukumaran. Then, the last effort was been done by the lawyers of Chan and Sukumaran, who approached the dean of Law from Ekasakti University, Dr. Otong Rosadi, and made him testified as an expert witness for the pair, in the attempt to convince the administrative court to hear the challenge against the refusal of president to grant clemency. However, like the previous efforts, it failed to prevent Chan and Sukumaran from the death row.

---

CHAPTER V

THE ENGAGEMENT BETWEEN INDONESIA AND AUSTRALIA AFTER THE CASE OF BALI NINE

In this chapter, the writer would like to analyze the indirect engagement between Australia and Indonesia after the case of Bali Nine. As the news was released about the dead convicted drug criminals from Australia Chan and Sukumaran were scheduled to be putted on the death row on 29 April 2015, the Australian, which included the government, media, and the citizens, were actively refusing the decision of Indonesian government and court. The Australian government, which in this case were actively engaging to Indonesian government, the prime minister and the foreign affairs minister, were feeling the necessity to protect their citizens not only at home but also abroad. The citizens of Australia were sending their sympathy and support for their fellow Australian that would be putted on the death row. Not to forget also sending their words towards the Indonesian government and its citizens, from the pleading words to freed the criminals in the name of human rights until the words of accusing and hatred towards the Indonesian government and its citizens, even the threat of boycotting the tourism sector of Indonesia.

5.1. Indonesia-Australia Relationship After The Case

The death penalty of Chan and Sukumaran finally took place and the Australian government deeply regretted the executions of Chan and Sukumaran after lots of clemency plea that had been given to Indonesian president by the lawyers and also the Australian prime minister. The Australian government then withdrew their Ambassador, suspended ministerial visit, and cutting foreign aid
for Indonesia. In the aftermath of the case, the Australians were even more furious.

On that year, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia also decreased, even though only a slight. However, that situation brought the prediction of Australian foreign minister to realization, where she stated that Australian would reconsider their plan to choose Bali for holiday if the execution still being implemented to the two Australian drug smuggler. Indonesian government side responded to Australian Prime Minister. Deputy Foreign minister AM. Fachir admitted that he does not see the reaction of Australian Government towards the death penalty as a threat and regarding Australian tourists who will travel to Indonesia, is a matter of interest of the people.

However, contrary to the statement of Indonesian Deputy Foreign minister, in result, the number of Australian tourist coming to Indonesia decreased slightly from 1,128,533 Australian tourists in 2014 to 1,090,025 in 2015, which decreased to 5%. Although slightly, the case had severe the trust that Australian putted towards Indonesia. Australian tourists still one of the prominent countries that contribute in the number of tourists coming to Indonesia. Amid the commotion of the death penalty towards the Australian drug smuggler, some of the events regarding promotion of Indonesian culture and tourism were being postponed, such as Indofest annual 2015 that supposed to be held on April, should be postponed due to the consideration in the Australian context it would be seen as insensitive, as stated from AIASA secretary Chris Majewski.

---


5.2. The Interest of Indonesia

Under the presidency of Joko Widodo, Indonesia puts tourism sector on the top priority program of Indonesia. The tourism industry of Indonesia has a huge contribution in gross domestic product (GDP) of the country because it will trigger more foreign exchange earnings while also providing the citizens with more job field in tourism sector and developing the economy of them. Indonesian Tourism Ministry Arief Yahya stated that the tourism sector contributes 10% of national GDP, with tourism foreign exchange contributes US$ 1.7 million of the GDP, the highest contribution compared to other sectors.113

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>391,862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>226,981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>314,432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>450,178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>584,437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>771,792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>931,109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>961,595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>997,984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>1,128,533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>1,090,025</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from year 2005 to 2015.114

As we can see from the table above, due to the Bali Nine case effect, the number of Australian tourists decreased slightly to 5%. Although slightly, the decreased number of Australian tourists shows how the case affected Australia,

both the government and the citizens. Whereas, before the execution occurred, the number of Australian tourists were increasing year by year.

Aside from the fact of the increasing number of Australian tourists amid the case of Bali Nine, the graphic shows that in 2006 there is significant decrease of the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia. This fact was caused by the Bali Bombing that happened twice, both in 2002 and 2005. Another decline was found in year 2015, when Chan and Sukumaran were executed by Indonesian law. This fact was following the act of Australians that created a trend #BoycottBali on social media as respond to the plan of death penalty of Chan and Sukumaran.

5.3. Engagement of Indonesia towards Australia

Keohane has stated about cooperation as “when actors adjust their behavior to the actual or anticipated preferences of others, through a process of

---


116 Ibid.
policy coordination,”¹¹⁷ and also “requires the actions of separate individuals or organizations, which are not in pre-existent harmony, be brought into conformity with one another through a process of negotiation”.¹¹⁸ Indonesia and Australia cooperation also has made their foreign policy to suit each other on fulfilling their own interest. It can be known with numbers of comprehensive agreements and negotiations in many sectors of cooperation. The agreements and negotiations were created in order to enhance a more developed cooperation in any sectors, such as the IA-CEPA, Declaration of Intent on Cooperation on Creative Economies, ASEAN-Australia-New Zealand Free Trade Area, and Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership. Beside that, they were created to maintain the likely challenges which both countries have ever faced and want to prevent it in the near future, such as the Lombok Treaty that aims to enhance cooperation in countering terrorism, transnational crime, and other security issues.¹¹⁹

With the occurrence of Bali Nine Case, Australian Prime Minister Abbott stated it will suffer its relationship with Indonesia.¹²⁰ With the withdrawal of Australian ambassador, suspended ministerial visit, and cutting foreign aid, the relationship between Australia and Indonesia become restrained. Indonesian government also realized about this possibility of restrained cooperation.¹²¹ Indonesian government has stated their wish to improve the cooperation with Australia after the executions, as Indonesian Foreign Ministry Spokesman Arrmanatha Nasir stated following the departure of Australian Ambassador,

“It is what it is, we certainly now want to look ahead at how we can improve cooperation... As I have said on many occasions, the Indonesia and Australia relationship is an important partnership, not only for Indonesia, but I believe for Australia. That’s why we want to look ahead so that we can immediately go back to increasing cooperation in many fields, whether it be security, politics, economy and culture.” 122

The idea of improving cooperation after the case was also stated by the Australian Prime Minister Abbott that stated,

“It (Indonesia-Australia bilateral relationship) is a strong relationship. Occasionally there are ups and downs, but certainly under this Government there will be no gratuitous offence given, there will be no shocks like the overnight cancellation of the live cattle trade in panic at a television programme. We want to be Indonesia’s trusted partner. We want to be the place that Indonesians naturally choose if they want an overseas education. We want Indonesia to be one of the places that Australians naturally choose, if they choose to holiday in our region, we want the very strong security partnership to continue to increase, and we want Australian and Indonesian businesses to naturally look to each other’s country as a place where they can do business and succeed”. 123

With both statements above from the representative of each countries, it is clear that both countries have mutual agreement on engaging to improve the cooperation back after the case. According to Mel Gurtov, engagement is a process of creating the space of resetting relationship, that involves reaching out to the other side in many ways that may catalyze new directions for policy, either the engaging state or the engaged one, with the objectives to reduce tensions and to establish a cooperative, mutually beneficial relationship with the means of respecting the leader of the rival state, giving assurances of security from threat, and providing an opportunity to benefit from the changed relationship through “sufficient and credible” inducements.124

On September 2015, Foreign Minister of Indonesia and Australia were finally meeting with each other for the first time after the execution of Chan and Sukumaran, which gave a light towards the bilateral relationship between both countries. Australian Foreign Minister Bishop stated in the interview with ABC, that the relationship between Australia and Indonesia is always be on strong footing despite of many issues faced by both countries. The meeting between Foreign Minister of Indonesia and Australia was discussing about the continuity of cooperation of both countries, including trade cooperation, defense and security cooperation. This meeting was then marked as the bilateral cooperation between both countries being back on track and leaving the issue of Bali Nine case behind.

5.3.1. People-to-People Engagement

On May 2016, Indonesian and Australian Ministry of Tourism Arief Yahya and Richard Colbeck held a meeting that discussed about sectors that can be cooperated by each other to increase the role of tourism sector in the economic development of each other, which one of them is joint promotion to increase the number of foreign tourists. It marks the commitment of both countries to enhance the tourism sector of each other, especially Indonesia, where tourism sector is one of its primary sector for its economic development, with Australia as the fourth biggest tourists to Indonesia.

As of 2016, Indonesia was the 12th largest visitors to come to Australia with the categories of visitors as tourists, family visitors, businessman, and students. As tourism sector is the major economic-driving and empower societies in Indonesia, Indonesian government begin to advertise more tourism spots other than Bali. With the introduction of ‘10 New Bali’, Indonesia encourages more Australian tourists to come to other spots beside Bali with the additional

---

encouragement by Australian ambassador to Indonesia Paul Grigson. Australian tourists started to visit other places beside Bali, which are Bintan and Flores, and marked as the cooperation that deepens between Australia and Indonesia, alongside the development of infrastructure of Indonesia in tourism sites. Indonesian government also realized that development in some of tourism sites in Indonesia could enhance the tourism sector of Indonesia to be world-class tourism. Following the new regulation from Indonesia, the commitment of Australia in funding Indonesia on the development of the infrastructure of tourism sites in many points of Indonesia helps Indonesia to expand its tourism sites and attract Australians to go those destinations as well.

5.4. Indirect Engagement of Indonesia to Australia to Increase Australian Tourists to Indonesia

This sub-chapter will explain about the engagement of Indonesia towards Australia to increase Australian tourists to Indonesia. The engagement will be using the approach of unconditional engagement which approaches the economic and cultural incentives. And then, followed by international cooperation where provides the actors with gains or rewards with different magnitude or kind for each state but give mutual level of interest.

After the case has turned cold, Indonesia and Australia decided to revive their cooperation in tourism sector. As the neighboring countries, Indonesia would not let its relation with Australia strained for a long time. Moreover, Australia is one of the prominent tourists that coming to Indonesia, as Bali is one of the prime destination for Australians to spend their holiday at. Beside, Indonesia under the presidency of Joko Widodo focuses on the role of tourism sector in developing the economy of Indonesia. Therefore, it is important for Indonesia to engage Australia and re-gain its trust.

5.4.1. Engagement Year 2015

Indonesian government started to concern about improving its tourism sector after the case ended by approaching Australia, one of the major contributors of Indonesian tourism. In this sub chapter, the case ended in the end of April 2015, the researcher will analyze the engagement and the dynamic changes of numbers of Australian tourists started from May 2015.

![Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia May-December 2015](image)

Figure 5.4.1. Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia on May to December 2015.

In 2015, Australian tourists coming to Indonesia decreased slightly from the year before. In fact, after the execution of the two Australian convicted, Indonesia had worked hard on re-attracting and regaining the trust of Australian tourists, through attrative events such as sport tourisms, engaging the Australian travel businesses, and also commemorating the late Australian armies that died at war and buried in Indonesia. In result, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia was fluctuative in 2015 and eventually not enough to surpass the number of Australian tourists from the previous year.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>83,790.128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>81,892.129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from April to May 2015.

After the case that took time in late April 2015, the number of Australian tourists decreased to 2% on May 2015, compared to May 2014. The death penalty towards Chan and Sukumaran in April become one of the reason that affected the interest of Australian tourists to go to Indonesia, especially Bali. Actions had been held by Indonesia in order to attract the Australians back to go to holiday in Indonesia. One of them is through sport tourism, which could improve the involvement of community to increase the global competitiveness and foreign exchange and also involved the tourism-based community. This is also one of the people-to-people link act that attracts citizens to participate in a sport event and led them to visit Indonesia.

One of the sport tourism is Wonderful Indonesia Fremantle to Bali Race and Rally 2015, held on 16 May 2015, organized by the Fremantle Sailing Club and partnered with Indonesian Ministry of Tourism. This event was held in order to promote nautical tourism and increase the image of tourism of Indonesia to the world, and also strengthen bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Australia with the expected 500 tourists, including Australians, participate in this event. There are 17 Australian yachts arrived at Benoa Port in Bali with

approximately 6 to 12 people in one yacht, that also sailed to the eastern part of Indonesia and enjoying the scenery and the wealthiness of Indonesian marine there.\(^{134}\) However, from the data found on May 2015, despite of sport tourism that had been held, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia still not surpassing the number of the previous month and even the same month on the previous year.\(^{135}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>81,892.(^{136})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>103,249.(^{137})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from May to June 2015.*

In June, the number of Australian tourists increased to 26% compare to the previous month. Indonesian Ministry of Tourism have taken actions in order to re-attract Australian tourists to visit Indonesia. One of the way was by engaging with the travel businesses that are operating in Western Australia to attract Australian tourists. In 2015, collaborating with Consulate General of the Republic of Indonesia in Perth, Indonesian Ministry of Tourism held Sales Mission Indonesia Perth 2015, that was attended by more than 100 attendees from travel businesses, which are from the airlines, wholesalers, and retailers travel agent that are operating in Western Australia with Indonesia as their market target.\(^{138}\) This event is held with the objective to bring together tourism industry of Indonesia to the wholesaler and retailer of Western Australia, such as making contracts of


attractive tourism packages and competing to sell those packages to the potential tourists in Western Australia market.

Aside from attracting Australian tourists to Indonesia to fulfill the target of 12 million foreign tourists to come to Indonesia, this event also contributed in developing the travel businesses of Western Australia, especially Perth as the biggest contributor of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia.\textsuperscript{139} This event gives reciprocal outcome for both side, with attractive and competitive holiday package offered by Indonesian Tourism Ministry for the Australian travel businesses with Indonesia as their offer towards potential Australian tourist.

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline
Month & Number of Australian Tourist \\
\hline
June & 103,249.\textsuperscript{140} \\
July & 90,961.\textsuperscript{141} \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\caption{Comparison of number of Australian tourists from June to July 2015.}
\end{table}

The number of Australian tourists decreased to almost 12\% on July 2015. This condition was not related to the Bali Nine case but rather caused by natural disaster, which is the eruption of Mount Raung in East Java on July 2015 that affected most of the area of Eastern Java and Bali. As the aftermath, the access to enter Ngurah Rai Airport was closed and many flight schedule to Bali from Australia were delayed for safety reason.\textsuperscript{142} There is no significant engagement from Indonesia to Australia also, as the natural disaster cannot be helped until the condition of the environment is stabilized by itself.

Other reason that occured was because of Ramadhan season in Indonesia that took time from middle of June until middle of July. Australian Foreign


Affairs and Trade Ministry released an official statement about all the possibilities that will occurred on Ramadhan season in Indonesia, such as majority of people that are muslim were fasting and the restaurants that are being closed. This advise also being referred to Bali, even though the majority belief in Bali is Hinduism. Therefore, it affected the preference of Australian tourists to go to Indonesia.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>July</td>
<td>90,961.144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>94,585.145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from July to August 2015.*

On August 2015, the number of Australian tourists increased to nearly 4%. This growth was following the meeting between Foreign Minister of Indonesia and Australia for the first time after the the execution of Chan and Sukumaran, which gave a light towards the bilateral relationship between both countries. Australian Foreign Minister Bishop stated in the interview with ABC, that the relationship between Australia and Indonesia is always be on strong footing despite of many issues faced by both countries.146

The meeting between Foreign Minister of Indonesia and Australia was discussing about the continuity of cooperation of both countries, including trade cooperation, defense and security cooperation, and also the plan for Australia to open its consulate in Makasar.147 This meeting was then marked as the bilateral cooperation between both countries being back on track and leaving the issue of Bali Nine case behind.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>94,585</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>105,374</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from August to September 2015.

The number of Australian tourists increased significantly to 11%. Other engagement has been done in this period between sister cities of Ambon and Darwin. The engagement between the leaders of sister city of Ambon and Darwin also strive to enhance their cooperation. For 32 years of cooperation, Ambon and Darwin have strong cooperations focusly on education sector. Both cities decided to widen their cooperation to tourism sector as well.

On September, there are lots of events that were being held by Ambon central government that attracts Australian tourists to go there. One of them is sport tourism, Darwin Ambon Yacht Race, which was sponsored and supported by Northern Territory government, Darwin City and the Sister City program, the Northern Territory Consulate of Indonesia, Ambon City Government, and the Yacht Associations and Indonesian hosts as well. The event was held coincided with the 70th Gull Force Commemoration, which is the Gull Force army exemption ceremony, where 200 Australian visited Ambon to commemorate their late family members that were joining in Batallion 2/21 Gull Force. With two events that were held coincidently, it brought more Australian tourists to go to Ambon because of the double interests that the tourists got from each of the events.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>105,374.152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>101,592.153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November</td>
<td>63,203.154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December</td>
<td>95,962.155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 5.4.1. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from September to December 2015.*

After September 2015, the numbers of Australian tourists on the last quarter of 2015 also fluctuated, by decreasing on the second and third month of the last quarter of 2015, and then increased again to 51% on the last month. With all the fluctuative movement of the numbers of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia in each month of 2015, the number decreased from the previous year.

5.4.2. Engagement Year 2016

In 2016, the number of Australian tourists began to thrive. As shown from the graphic above, the numbers of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia went fluctuative but the number of each month had made it to surpass the numbers from the previous year. This fact is mostly caused by the enactment of free visa-entry for Australian tourists starting from March 2016. The spike of Australian tourists also began from month April 2016 after the Australia has been included in the list of countries who get free visa-entry.

Figure 5.4.2. Australian Tourists Coming to Indonesia on 2016.
Month | Number of Australian Tourist  
--- | ---  
January | 95,587.156  
February | 73,160.157  
March | 90,846.158  

*Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from January to March 2016.*

As the table above shows, the number of Australian tourists got increase on March 2016. On March 2016, Indonesia included Australia on the list of countries who are granted free visa-entry as attached on Republic of Indonesia Presidential Regulation number 21 year 2016 about Free Visa-Entry. In that way, it would give ease to the Australian tourists and increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia. Beside that, it could also give frequent engagement and build bridges to a more understanding between Australian and Indonesian.

Month | Number of Australian Tourist  
--- | ---  
March | 90,846.160  
April | 95,399.161  
May | 102,693.162  

*Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from April to May 2016.*

On the following month, Indonesia held a culture and art festival titled Wonderful Indonesia Festival and Travel Fair (WIFest 2016) for two days, from

---

159 Bebas Visa Kunjungan, Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia No. 21, Lampiran (2016).  
30 April to 1 May 2016 at Sydney. This event was held by NFX Media and fully supported by Indonesian Tourism Ministry and partnered by Indonesian General Consulate at Sydney that raising the Indonesian communities to participate in the event. This festival aims to attract more Australian tourists to visit Indonesia through travel package promotion, art and cultural show, traditional food, music and introduction of other tourism destination, and as well as to promote the wealth and diversity of Indonesia to Australians. Holiday package promotion booth was more attractive for the Australians that sought for business or holiday plans to Indonesia. This fact then shows the enthusiasm of Australian towards Indonesia as their next holiday destination or business, especially with the information of free visa-entry.

Generally, the festivals are organized in order to answer the specific needs of a community and to offer entertainment at the same time. Events and festivals also beneficial for exchanging knowledge and tightening the relations between neighbors and also uniting the communities. Festivals like WIFest are essential to promote Indonesia by attracting tourists and also giving understanding towards Australia from Indonesia, decreasing any hard feelings that were gotten from the past conflict, which is Bali Nine case. As the result, more and more tourists from Australian came to Indonesia in this period.

---


Month | Number of Australian Tourist
---|---
May | 102,693.166
June | 114,677.167
July | 118,389.168
August | 100,484.169
September | 115,255.170
October | 104,587.171

Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from May to October 2016.

On June 2016, Australian tourists had setted a new record for reaching the highest number of Australian tourists from any month ever, which were 114,677 Australian tourists coming to Indonesia.172 Bali remains to be the most favourited destination for Australian tourists, setting aside New Zealand as the main destination for any travelers.173 According to Deputy for Central Bureau Statistics (BPS) Statistics and Services, Sasmito Hadi Wibowo, this record was gotten because of intensive tourism campaign by the government and tourism destination attractions which became the attractiveness of Indonesian tourism.174 This fact then stimulate the growing number of not only Australian tourists, but also tourists from other countries.

---

In July, the number even got increased to 3%. In this period, through The Travel Industry Exhibition 2016, Indonesian Tourism Ministry managed to maintain the promotion of Indonesian tourism. This exhibition facilitates the contact and contract of business between Indonesian sellers and Australian buyers. With the participation of Indonesia in this exhibition, it could maintain the arrivals of Australian tourists to come to Indonesia. Regional Representative of People of Bali also present as well in this activity to do in-depth monitoring of the activity to attract more Australian tourists to Indonesia.

Beside that, on August 2016, Indonesia launched the development of areas that are considered to be the other options for tourism aside from Bali, which is titled “10 New Bali”. This project was first promoted by Indonesian Tourism Ministry in OzAsia Festival 2016, which is the biggest asian cultural festival in South Australian territory. This festival was held from 20 September until 2 October 2016. On its effort to create this project, Indonesian government encourage all foreign tourists to not only visit Bali but other holiday destination which are Toba Lake, Tanjung Kelayang, Kepulauan Seribu, Tanjung Lesung, Borobudur Temple, Mount Bromo, Mandalika Beach, Wakatobi, Labuhan Bajo and Morotai Island. The Australian Ambassador for Indonesia Paul Grigson also encourages the Australians to not only visit Bali for their holiday but also another big cities or islands of Indonesia. Indonesian government also encourage Australian stakeholder to invest on the tourism sites in order to help the development of the infrastructure and also giving them benefits once the tourism sites have developed. Australian government then agree to give aid in the form of

---


funding for three tourism destination in Indonesia, which are Labuan Bajo (East Nusa Tenggara), Toba Lake (North Sumatra) and North Kalimantan area.\textsuperscript{178}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>104,587.\textsuperscript{179}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November</td>
<td>89,740.\textsuperscript{180}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December</td>
<td>97,216.\textsuperscript{181}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textit{Table 5.4.2. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from October to December 2016.}

As of November, the number of Australian tourists decreased to 14%. Even in a sport event, Borobudur Marathon 2016 held on 20 November 2016 by Central Java local government and supported by Indonesian Ministry of Tourism, aside from 17 countries of the participants including Kenya, Ethiopia, Nigeria, France, United States, Singapore, Japan, Malaysia and Indonesia, there were no Australian participants that join in this sport event.\textsuperscript{182} And then, beside that, there is no program from Indonesia for Australian government or citizens to attract them in the sector of tourism. However, in December, the number of Australian tourists increased slightly to approximately 8%, but surpassing the number of previous year on the same month. Finally, the numbers of Australian tourists resulted to a satisfying number of arrival to Indonesia after many engagement that had been done by Indonesia.

5.5. The Result of Engagement by Indonesia towards Australia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Australian Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>1,090,025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>1,302,292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 5.5. Comparison of number of Australian tourists from year 2015 to 2016.*

As the result, noted in 2016, the number of Australians coming to Indonesia increased to 1,302,292 from 1,090,025 on the previous year, even bigger from the year before the death penalty took place. With the efforts of engagement Indonesian government to revive the numbers of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia, not only towards the government but also towards the Australian business owner and Australian citizens.

*Graphic 5.5. Australian Tourist Coming to Indonesia 2005-2016.*

---


184 Ibid.

As the graphic shown above, in 2016, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia was even higher than the previous years before the execution of Chan and Sukumaran occured. The role of Indonesian government in engaging Australia has successfully attracted the Australian tourists back to go holiday in Indonesia and even attracts them to other holiday destinations beside Bali through its ’10 New Bali’ project, for the sake of the goal of Indonesian government to enhance its tourism sector.

Despite of the case, Indonesia and Australia will always have to maintain their relationship. Indonesian Foreign Minister Retno Marsudi has stated that she and Australian Foreign Minister Bishop has agreed to enhance the bilateral relationship together. The step will be started from enhancing the role of people-to-people contact and dialogue between both countries.\(^\text{186}\) She also stated that the economic cooperation that is tightly connected will enhance the bilateral relation between Indonesia and Australia.\(^\text{187}\) Indonesian Member of House of Representative, Khilmi, also stated after the execution, that he wished both countries can immediately improve their relationship. He stated that the role of Australian tourists are important for the interest of Indonesia.\(^\text{188}\) Therefore, the engagement from Indonesia towards Australia is an important thing to do to increase the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia.

The same positive thought about improving cooperation between Indonesia and Australia also given by Australian government. According to the former Australian Embassy for Indonesia Paul Grigson, in order to resolve many
differences between the two countries, they keep focusing on the two-way communication that has already been maintained by both countries and also the strength of their relationship as both countries have many common things. Therefore, the case does not have to necessarily break the relationship for a long time, as the cooperation between the two countries is much more important.

From the side of Indonesian Tourism Ministry, as of 2016, it will keep intensify the tourism promotion to Australia, especially promotion of Australian’s favourite destinations such as Bali, Jakarta, West Nusa Tenggara, West Java and Yogyakarta. Australia as the closest neighbour and one of the largest number of tourists to Indonesia, encourages Indonesia to be all out in attracting Australia through promotions, as stated by Asia Pacific Market Development Assistant for Indonesian Ministry of Tourism, Vinsensius Jemadu. From that, it is shown how the efforts of Indonesian Ministry of Tourism will bring a huge impact in attracting Australian tourists to Indonesia and resolving any hard feelings that have ever lingered between both countries.

The engagement of Indonesia towards Australia, not only to governmental side but also the private sector and the public itself, has proven to attract the Australian tourists to Indonesia. According to Supriyadi, journalists of Warta Bea Cukai (News of Customs), the engagement towards other government through better coordination, and information and system exchange that is used to make the policy being issued also can facilitate the tourists visit to be easier. The grant of Free Visa-Entry for Australian tourists from Indonesian government is the

---


example of government coordination on making the policy to facilitate the ease of travel for Australian tourists.

Supriyadi also stated that the engagement towards private sector also important to increase the number of tourists. The ease of spreading the information of tourism objects in Indonesia could be done through collaboration in making promotional strategy with those private sectors. The steps would be by introducing exciting tourism and packages destinations in Indonesia through Sales Mission that is implemented by Indonesian Ministry of Tourism to several big cities in many regions, including Australia.193 As mentioned in the previous sub-chapter, one of the engagement efforts done by Indonesian Ministry of Tourism towards Australia is through Sales Mission, with Australian travel bussinesses as the target.

Another thing that bring ease to the efforts of the engagement of Indonesia towards Australia is the activity of people-to-people links. As stated by Indonesian Deputy Minister of Tourism for International Marketing, Dewi Savitri Wahab, when the relationship of both countries was restrained caused by the death penalty, the activity of people-to-people still in high rate. Dr. Steven Farram, Lecturer of History in the field of Northern Australia and ASEAN history explained that the people-to-people relationship which shows the high interest of Northern Territory citizens towards Indonesia is what kept Indonesia and Australia still maintain a good relationship. Australians would regularly visit Indonesia and many of them even thought of Indonesia as their second home.194 Hence, when Indonesia gives their effort in attracting Australian tourists to Indonesia, it would be not difficult for Australia to be attracted.

In the researcher’s opinion, after Bali Nine case, the engagement towards Australia by Indonesia in order to increase the Australian tourists is necessary to

be done. As explained in the first chapter, the objectives of engagement are to decrease tensions and to establish a cooperative and mutually beneficial relationship with the means of respecting the leader of the opposed state, giving sureness of security from threat, and providing an opportunity to benefit from the changed relationship through sufficient and credible inducements.\textsuperscript{195} The improvement of the number of Australian tourists by Indonesia after the Bali Nine case can be reached out through the engagement efforts.

Australian tourists are the number fourth largest contributor of Indonesian tourism sector.\textsuperscript{196} If this fact is related to the fact that tourism sector is Indonesian primary sector for its economic development, then it makes Australia as a significant contributor in Indonesian economic development. Then, the engagement towards Australia through many steps, such as granting free visa-entry, marketing coordination with Australian travel businesses through Sales Mission, the engagement towards the Australians through cultural festivals and cultural exchanges are important to be done in order to fulfill the interest of Indonesia, which is increasing the Australian tourists to Indonesia after its decreasing following the execution of the Bali Nine duo.

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION

Indonesia is the most favourited holiday destination for Australians, even surpassing New Zealand, because of its beauty and cultural diversity that are unavailable anywhere but Indonesia itself. However, Bali Nine case as one of many conflicts in the history of bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Australia led to a possible threat of restrained cooperations. One of them was giving an impact towards Indonesian tourism sector, where the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia decreased caused by the execution. This fact then led to the indirect engagement efforts from the Indonesian side to attract the Australian tourists, especially after the case that left hard feelings. This engagement from Indonesian government highly influence the numbers of Australian tourists to come to Indonesia.

Indirect engagement through people-to-people cooperation, which are through cultural festival, sport tourism, ‘10 New Bali’ campaign, sister cities engagement, free visa-entry, and sales mission towards Australian are the acts that have been done by Indonesian government to attract and improve the number of Australian tourists to Indonesia. Those acts have attracted more Australian tourists to Indonesia, and therefore increased the number of them.

From many acts done by Indonesia, one of the most important act by Indonesian government that gave significant improvement to the number of Australian tourists is the grant of free visa-entry from Indonesia for the Australian tourists. This act has resulted to a new record of Indonesia for reaching the highest number of arrival of Australian tourists from any month ever in June 2016, three months after the free visa-entry was granted to Australia.

The engagement through sister cities also ensures the cooperation in tourism sector, such as between Maluku and Darwin, where both cities are
committed to enhance their cooperation in tourism sector, cultural exchange, and encourage Australians to visit Maluku beside Bali and vice versa. The initiative of Indonesia to commemorate the late Australian soldiers that passed away in Maluku is also highly appreciated by Australia and thus gaining the trust of Australia and attract them to go to Indonesia to join the commemoration of their late family and national heroes as well.

Other than that, the role of events held by Indonesian Ministry of Tourism by holding cultural festivals and sport tourism at home and abroad also proven to be effective in attracting many Australian tourists to come to Indonesia. Those cultural festivals and sport tourism were held as attractive and informative as possible in order to give awareness of Indonesian tourism, especially the awareness of the '10 New Bali'. '10 New Bali' has the objective to encourage all foreign tourists to go to other holiday destinations beside Bali. From this effort, many Australians expressed their interest to visit other holiday destinations beside Bali.

Engagement towards Australian travel businesses also effective in attracting more Australian tourists to go to Indonesia. Many attractive travel packages that is offered by Indonesia to the Australian travel business that encourage these travel business to attract more Australians to go to Indonesia. Moreover, with the free visa-entry that give the ease of travel to Indonesia for Australia, and also another options of holiday destinations beside Bali that are also attractive, the travel businesses gained the easiness in offering the travel packages to Indonesia to Australians and certainly more profits for themselves by selling them.

As the result, the number of Australian tourists coming to Indonesia was increased from the year of the Bali Nine case, even higher than the previous years before the execution of Chan and Sukumaran occurred. Then, from the fact of the increased number of Australian tourists in the following year after the Bali Nine case, Indonesia has succeeded in indirectly engaging Australia to fulfill its interest on improving the tourism sector.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Journal Articles


**Government Publications**

Bebas Visa Kunjungan, Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia No. 21, Lampiran (2016).

Menteri Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia RI. (n.d.). Rancangan Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia tentang Kitab Undang-Undang Hukum Pidana. PUTUSAN No. 38 PK/PID.SUS/2011, 1 (Mahkamah Agung Republik Indonesia 2011).

**Newspapers and Magazines**


Reports


Kemenpar. (2015, August). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Agustus 2015.
Kemenpar. (2015, April). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan April 2015.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Desember 2015.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Juli 2015.
Kemenpar. (2015, Juni). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Juni 2015.
Kemenpar. (2015, Mei). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Mei 2015.
Kemenpar. (2015, November). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan November 2015.
Kemenpar. (2015, Oktober). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Oktober 2015.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan September 2015.
Kemenpar. (2016, April). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan April 2016.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Agustus 2016.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Desember 2016.
Kemenpar. (2016, Februari). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Februari 2016.
Kemenpar. (2016, Januari). JUMLAH KUNJUNGAN WISATAWAN
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Januari 2016.
MANCANEGARA MENURUT PINTU MASUK DAN KEBANGSAAN
Bulan Juli 2016.


Treaties


Speeches and Interviews


Websites


APPENDIX

Timeline of the case of Chan and Sukumaran

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Events</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17 April 2005</td>
<td>Nine Australian arrested at Denpasar airport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 August 2005</td>
<td>Australian Federal Police (AFP) confirm their involvement in the investigations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 October 2005</td>
<td>Two of the suspects, Scott Rush and Renae Lawrence started to bring act against the AFP because of their involvement in passing information to Indonesian’s officials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 October 2005</td>
<td>First trial for Michael Czugaj and Myuran Sukumaran in Denpasar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 October 2005</td>
<td>First trial for Martin Stephens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 October 2005</td>
<td>First trial of Andrew Chan and Scott Rush</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 October 2005</td>
<td>First trial of Renae Lawrence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 February 2006</td>
<td>Renae Lawrence and Scott Rush were sentenced to life in prison by the Denpasar district court.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 February 2006</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran were found guilty and sentenced to death by firing squad. Michael Czugaj and Martin Stephens were sentenced to life imprisonment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 February 2006</td>
<td>Matthew Norman, Si Yi Chen and Tan Duc Thanh Nguyen were sentenced to life in prison.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 February 2006</td>
<td>The lawyer of Renae Lawrence proposed for an application to appeal her life sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 February 2006</td>
<td>The lawyer of Scott Rush announced they will focus on</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26 April 2006</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran's appeal of their sentence were rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 April 2006</td>
<td>The sentences of Lawrence, Czugaj, Norman, Nguyen and Chen were reduced to 20 years by the court. The life sentences of Rush and Stephens were upheld.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 April 2006</td>
<td>Indonesian prosecutors announced their intention to appeal against the reduced sentences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 September 2006</td>
<td>Rush, Nguyen, Chen, and Norman were sentenced to death after prosecutors appealed against their lighter jail sentences. Czugaj had his punishment increased from the reduced 20-year jail to life imprisonment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 January 2007</td>
<td>Lawyers filed further challenges and appeals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 July 2007</td>
<td>Australian Prime Minister John Howard raised the issue of the Bali Nine group to Indonesian President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**High Court Session**

**Supreme Court Session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 March 2008</td>
<td>The death sentences of Nguyen, Chen and Norman were reduced to life in jail by Indonesia Supreme Court.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 April 2010</td>
<td>Stephens lodges his request for a judicial review of his life sentence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 August 2010</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran lodged judicial review requests of their death sentences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 August 2010</td>
<td>Rush appeared in court for his final appeal, bolstered by a letter from the AFP stating he played only a minor role in the case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 October 2010</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran lodge judicial review requests of their death sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 May 2011</td>
<td>Rush’s death sentence was reduced to life imprisonment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event_description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 July 2011</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran lost judicial review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2012</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran begged to president SBY to pardon them from execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2012</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran received one year reprieve from their death penalties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 May 2014</td>
<td>Lawrence announces plans to seek parole</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 December 2014</td>
<td>President Jokowi said no mercy for the two criminals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 January 2015</td>
<td>Australian prime minister confirmed the loss of Sukumaran's final avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 January 2015</td>
<td>Tony Abbott appeals directly to President Jokowi to give the two criminals mercy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 January 2015</td>
<td>Chan's plea for clemency from execution also rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 January 2015</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran officially filed applications for a judicial review of their cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 February 2015</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran placed in the next round of execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 February 2015</td>
<td>The lawyers of Chan and Sukumaran launched a challenge against Indonesian president, which was rejected two days later by the attorney-general.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 February 2015</td>
<td>Indonesian president defended his reasons for refusing to grant clemency to Chan and Sukumaran.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 February 2015</td>
<td>Abbott mentioned tsunami relief in the renewed clemency plea, execution delayed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 February 2015</td>
<td>Challenge against clemency refusal dismissed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 March 2015</td>
<td>Chief prosecutor of Bali stated his plan to transfer Chan and Sukumaran out of Bali prison in the next two days in preparation for their executions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 March 2015</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran left Bali prison for the prison where they would be executed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 March 2015</td>
<td>Australian foreign minister Julie Bishop suggested prisoner swap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 March 2015</td>
<td>The executions were delayed until all legal avenues were explored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 March 2015</td>
<td>A senior Islamic cleric of Australia traveled to Indonesian capital to plead for the lives of Chan and Sukumaran.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 March 2015</td>
<td>The executions were delayed due to the legal appeals had not finished.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 March 2015</td>
<td>Cases adjourned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 March 2015</td>
<td>The dean of Law from Ekasakti University, Dr. Otong Rosadi testified as an expert witness for the pair, attempted to convince the administrative court to hear the challenge against the refusal of president to grant clemency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 April 2015</td>
<td>The appeal of Chan and Sukumaran against the refusal of president to grant clemency was rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 April 2015</td>
<td>Formal notification of execution was given to Chan and Sukumaran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 April 2015</td>
<td>Chan and Sukumaran were executed by the firing squad</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>